

8
H-36

** K U K O T A I and B O K M U R U N : **
** a comparison of two related heroic poems **
** of the Kirgiz - II **
** by A.T.Hatto **

KUKOTAY and BOK MURUN:

A COMPARISON OF TWO RELATED HEROIC
POEMS OF THE KIRGHIZ - II

By A.T.Hatto

Reprinted from the Bulletin of the School of Oriental
and African Studies, University of London, vol.XXXII,
Part 3, 1969

8(54)
736

-1-
Дундуомеке Алаг. Магж Купр. ССР

KUKOTAY AND BOK MURUN: A COMPARISON OF TWO RELATED HEROIC POEMS OF THE KIRGIZ—II¹

By A. T. HARTO

Kukotay (K) and *Bok Murun (BM)* have epithets and formulae of greater or lesser elaborateness in common. Some of the more interesting of these will be adduced and compared, as will some of the more interesting discrepancies between *K* and *BM* on the way, since they throw light on the nature of their common source and of the Kirgiz epic tradition.

Although the total impressions of Manas's person and presence given by *K* and *BM* are similar, the only epithet they share is the very general *baatir* 'warrior', 'hero'.² They also agree that Manas is the son of Yakub/Jakup.³ *K* presents Manas as 'young', 'just beginning to distinguish himself';⁴ indeed there is a formula 'in his twelfth year he loosed [his first] arrow, in his thirteenth he defeated and plundered a people',⁵ which is varied and extended to his fifteenth year in another passage with the shift—so typical of oral poetry—that the feat attributed to the thirteenth year in the former is given to the fourteenth in the latter, while the fifteenth makes him ruler of a mighty people—of which people is not stated, though it cannot be the Nogay.⁶ Without being precise, *BM* seems to present Manas as no longer quite so young. 77 *könü-minän erkä öskön* implies that he has grown to manhood in a society in which all men are warriors and more or less heroes: and whereas *BM* confirms *er [ér]* in *erkä* by frequently bestowing the title 'Er' on Manas,⁷ *K* never prefixes 'Ir-' to his name,⁸ despite his heroic exploits, but instead gives him the epithet 'young'.⁹ The formula 'in his twelfth year...' has no parallel in *BM*, but appropriately it has one in Radlov's 'Birth of Manas' at 153 *on jaşında ok atkan, / on törtünö äkkanda, / ordo äaikan kan bolgon*.¹⁰ In *BM*, Manas is nevertheless young enough to share the epithet *tentäk* 'Hothead' with Bok Murun.¹¹ A curious epithet in *K* refers to Manas as one who grew fat in Andizhan by gnawing ripe apples of that city.¹² This, as I have suggested elsewhere, must have come to him from his mother, who, according to Sagymbay's version of his conception, ate a sweet apple large as a bowl so that her belly was filled, i.e. swelled (7, 22 *ayaktay bolgon ak alma, / abdan širin bal*

¹ For part I, see *BSOAS*, xxxii, 2, 1969, 344-78.

² *K*, 294, 1; *BM*, 1958.

³ *K*, 291, 8; *BM*, 79.

⁴ 291, 8.

⁵ 291, 7.

⁶ 298, 11 f.

⁷ e.g. 75 *kandü tügan Er Manas* 'blood-born Er Manas', see below, p. 554.

⁸ cf. 'Ir-Kosay' in Valikhanov's transcription.

⁹ 291, 8; 298, 11.

¹⁰ 'In his tenth year he shot [his first] arrow, on reaching his fourteenth he became a palace-destroying khan'. Manas's genealogy in this short poem, which I have elsewhere named 'R', differs from that of *K*, and it therefore belonged to a different tradition. The formula is thus clearly a migratory motif.

¹¹ See below, p. 547 f.

¹² 291, 5 = 292, 7 (though not in identical words).

-405161-

Ц:	...
AK:	...

alma, / *alma ſer iči toluptur . . .*).¹³ The misattribution of the epithet could easily have arisen from a modal expression in the Kirgiz with or without the genderless possessed affix ('grew fat from someone's having eaten an apple . . .'). Apart from these epithets, which would seem to associate Manas with Andizhan through his mother, *K* in a speech of Bok Murun's names Manas a 'Sart' (townsman) of Samarkand (292, 29). Like all mountain peoples, the Kirgiz normally regard the town-dwelling plainsmen with contempt, and there is reason to think that Bok Murun is expressing contempt for Manas here since he is disclaiming that he will go to Manas for the Great Feast of Kōkōtōy as he was instructed to do in that Khan's 'Behest'. Contempt for Manas was no doubt safe at such a distance, presumably in Uch-Turfan:¹⁴ but in all his factual dealings with Manas through intermediaries Bok Murun in *K* shows great respect towards him. The only epithet in *BM* that localizes Manas is at 1834: *Čatkaldagı Manaska / čabūldu koyormun* 'I shall deliver an attack on Manas of the Chatkal region', that is the Chatkal river and valley below the Chatkal Range, 150 km. north of Andizhan. That this is the or at least a 'domestic' locality of Manas is indicated by Joloy's last boast. When he has run Manas to ground he will seize by her white wrist Manas's wife Kanikey: 1836 *aıttırıp kaıy berdirgān / Kan balası Kanıkāi / ač bilāktān aların.*¹⁵ The same general region is implied elsewhere in *BM* when Manas sends a message to his armourer Tōkōr who is with Jakıp on the Talas.¹⁶ This mountainous milieu is in keeping with the setting in which Manas first receives Bok Murun's invitation: he is playing chess with Alman Bet at the source of the Ulu Kamyı.¹⁷ An epithet in *K* runs 'he who drives cattle over high mountains'.¹⁸ Mountainous features occur in epithets and similes for Manas in *BM*—see the discussion of the *Jōlōnūs*-epithet below,¹⁹ and also Valikhanov's report of a Manas-simile involving the precipitous Tiek-Tash.²⁰ There can be no doubt but that the Kirgiz conceived of Manas as a man of the mountains like themselves. Indeed, like them he is anti-Sart: v, 1, (3), 382 *Sartın jurtun sapıramın* 'I shall scatter the Sart people', he says. Bok Murun's abusive allegation that Manas is a Sart can thus rest at most on passing episodes in Manas's career (leaving aside the misapplied epithet of the apples of Andizhan).²¹

K and *BM* convey a similar impression of Manas's formidable aspect whilst

¹³ cf. my article 'The birth of Manas', *Asia Major*, NS, xiv, 2, 1969.

¹⁴ See part 1 of this article, *BSOAS*, xxxii, 2, 1969.

¹⁵ As Radlov translates it, it could be a chance encounter on the Chatkal: 'Am Tschatkal will ich Manas einen guten Kampf bereiten'. Under *ač* 11, Yudakhin, *Slovar*, renders *ač bilek* as 'sil'naya ruka'; under *bilek* he lists the collocation *ak bilek* 'beloruchka'. Reference to *ač* 1 2 'svetly' would give 'gleaming (fore)arms'. The emphasis is on Kanikey's beauty as a prize, not on her strength as a fighting-woman, cf. *BM*, 58 (cited in pt. 1, p. 352), which assures *ač* against *ak*. *K* in a parallel passage has *belye ruki*, *ibid.*

¹⁶ See below, p. 566 f.

¹⁷ *BM*, 277.

¹⁸ 291, 10.

¹⁹ pp. 544 ff.

²⁰ Part 1, 356.

²¹ *BM* also has a passage in which Bok Murun voices ineffective resentment towards Manas: 249 'If the Hothead comes he will create public disorder; if he wants to come, let him, if not, so be it!'

using for
face is co
blue-blac
is probab
hyena' (c
quotation
Kirgiz or
very stro
to do her
also know
correctly
not occur
group of
for Alma
bōri in th
above all
aspect is c

' His face
mountain
northern
right hand
brows low
grown up
thigh-bon

²² 291, 1

²³ *Oche*

²⁴ cf. *Oz*

²⁵ On th

344. Since

²⁶ See p

²⁷ Radlo

²⁸ v, 1, (

could
it the
...').
lizhan
Sart'
Kirgiz
ere is
since
as lie
as' no
ll his
hows
is at
k on
v the
ast a
e has
key:
un.¹⁵
ds a
oun-
Bok
the
oun-
s in
ov's
e no
like
rtun
sive
s in
a).²¹
ilst

akal
k as
5 1 2
rize,
s ad

las:
not,

using formulae differing from each other's. In *K*, Manas's brows are knit, his face is cold, his blood black but his body pale, his belly mottled, his backbone blue-black, his stature tall.²² His blue-black backbone (*khrebet siniy*, 291, 12) is probably to be taken together with 'he is like a blue-black maned bristling hyena' (*on podobn sinegrivoy shchetinistoy giene*, 291, 14). The fact that in a quotation in an essay written in 1860 Valikhanov gives the noun in the lost Kirgiz original of *K* as 'wolf' (*on podobn sinegrivomu volku*),²³ not hyena, very strongly suggests that there was no noun in the original and that we have to do here with the prominent heroic epithet *kökjal* 'Blue-mane' i.e. 'wolf', also known from other Turkic traditions.²⁴ Thus Valikhanov has 'wolf' correctly in 1860 and 'hyena' erroneously in *K* in 1861 or later.²⁵ *kökjal* does not occur in *BM*, though *börü* 'wolf' does;²⁶ but one of the bards of the group of poems to which *BM* belongs knows it, cf. *kökjal döböt börüdöi*, standing for Alman Bet, where *döböt* 'male' before *börü-* recalls *örkäk* 'male' before *böri* in the *Oguz-name*.²⁷ Black blood in *K* is a commonplace in Radlov's texts, above all for Alman Bet (whose lice are blue).²⁸ In *BM*, Manas's formidable aspect is conjured up by means of the following epithets:

66 Tokoido ayu bellängän,
belüstä jolbors baştangan,
čayan köstü čap jäktü
teskai jakka kıştagan,
enädän jañ tüšköndö,
koi börindai kara kan
oñ koluna uštagan,
kabagı bık, kaşı bas,
kösü kızıl öñü sas
kandü tügan Er Manas,
kölöködö kön öskön,
könü-minän erkä öskön,
aşıktü jilik jotosu . . .

'His face like that of the bear in the forest, his head like that of the tiger on mountain-spur, scorpion-eyed, strong-jawed, he that winters on the sunless northern slopes, who, as he descended from his mother's womb, clutched in his right hand a clot of black blood as large as a sheep's liver, his eyelids high, his brows low, his eyes red, his visage sallow, bloody-born Er Manas, having grown up in the shadows, grown to manly courage, endowed with mighty thigh-bones . . .'

²² 291, 11 ff.

²³ 'Očerki Dzhungarii', written in 1860, *Sobranie sochineniy*, I, 421, 3.

²⁴ cf. *Oguz-name*, 16, 5 f. *kök fallug bşduk bir örkäk böri*.

²⁵ On the date of *K* (i.e. the text of the extant translation, not the lost original), see part I, 344. Since 1860, Valikhanov may have met the Manas-epithet 'Hyena'.

²⁶ See pp. 544 ff., below, and n. 42.

²⁷ Radlov, V, I, (3), 358; cf. *Oguz-name*, 16, 5 quoted in n. 24, above.

²⁸ V, I, (2), 1790; (5), 1056.

Radlov's text at 67 *belästai* has to be emended to *belüstā*: (i) it is parallel as a locative to *tokoido* at 66; (ii) cf. the parallel passage *BM*, 910 *belüstā jolbors baštangan*, with 909 and 911 = 66 and 68. Radlov not only failed to collate, but his translation also has serious errors.²⁹ Manas's birth with a blood-clot in his hand (narrated at length by Sagymbay) implies world-conquest, as with Činggis; ³⁰ it is taken up again in the stereotype l. 75 *kandū tūgan Er Manas* 'born having, i.e. holding blood'. The element 71 *koi bōrindai kara kan*, here attached to the birth, recurs twice in *BM* in the totally different context of Alman Bet's battle-wounds (1577: 2103, cf. (5), 2168). 76 *kōlōkōdō kōn. ōskōn* may well refer to the same motif as provided the following line of Radlov's 'Birth of Manas' recorded from a different tribe: *Manas kabak jerdān buguldu* 'Manas was concealed in a hollow (secluded place)'.³¹ In other passages the epithet *kabulan tūgan* 'tiger-born' is applied to Manas, though it is not exclusively his (275; 477 etc.; cf. 496—Koşoy): Sagymbay converts this traditional epithet into narrative, too.³²

But the most complex of all these animal epithets concerns the Wolf.

In *BM* there are four occurrences of an epithet for a hero that link a geographical feature with the symbol of the Wolf (530; 590; 676; 1080); and there are several instances of its use in other of Radlov's recordings from the same school of bards (e.g. v, 1, (3), 358; 1709). In *BM* the formula is fundamentally

Jölönüs tō kerisi,
busurmandın bōrüsü ...

'Lofty green slope of "Mount Jölönüs", Wolf of the Muslims ...'

In his translations Radlov did not collate the various occurrences and he got the sense wrong after getting it right.³³ In all four instances in *BM*, the epithet refers to Manas. At 676 *bistin* 'our' is introduced (*bistin Jölönüs tō kerisi*); and at 1080 *sarı* occurs (*Jölönüs sarı keräsi*).³⁴ It would be possible to accommodate *sarı* as 'yellow', indicating a seasonal change on the 'high green slope' (*keri*), but this is challenged by v, 1, (3), 358, which has *sarida*:

kök jal dōbōt bōrüdōi
Jölönüs sarida keredā
Alman Bēt aidap jürōt:

²⁹ 66 ff., 'Der im Wald mit Bären kämpft, Der da anfüllt wilde Tiger ...'

³⁰ See 'The birth of Manas', loc. cit.

³¹ Radlov, v, 1, (1), 63.

³² See 'The birth of Manas', 233 ff.

³³ 530: 'Er, der Fuss des Jölönüs Berg's, Er, der Wolf von allen Moslim, Manas ...' (correct, except that *keri* = *kerüü* = 'summit' or 'green slope of high mountain'); similarly 590 'Du [Manas], der Fuss des Jölönüs Berg's, Du der Wolf der Muselmane'; and 676 'Unser [Bistin] Fuss des Jölönüs Berg's, Unser Wolf der Muselmane, Held Manas ...'; but at 1080 (Kök Koyan speaking) 'Hier am Fusse des Jölönüs, ich, der Wolf der Muselmane ...'. 'Hier am Fusse' and 'ich' are of course wrong: Kök Koyan is really apostrophizing Manas, to whom the epithet applies.

³⁴ Radlov thus. He therefore vacillates between *keri* and *kerä*, only the former of which is supported by Yudakhin's *Slovar*.

Radlov rende
Berg's Pfade
sarı in sarida
does not cit
thinking tha
strange epit
whole passag
particle -dai

Thus there
punctuation)
Clearly the
that Jölönüs
to kök jal dō
place on wh
kerädāi tō k
suspicion of
a couplet wit
the same bar

Radlov's att
surprising in
feature as th
Vorsprung d
means 'high
never looked
A new ele
Lines (3), 35
the famous
symbol of t
'Blue-mane'
pious taste
that the simi

³⁵ Radlov n
sarı ker ekān/ke
mit blauer Mäh
Ho obviously f

³⁶ Radlov d

Radlov renders: 'Wie der grimme Wolf mit blauer Mähne, / Auf des Jölönusch Berg's Pfade / Trieb die Heerde Alman Bet'. Radlov thus appears to take *sari* in *sarida* as absolute for *sari jal* 'caravan- or cattle-track'; but Yudakhin does not cite an absolute *sari* with this meaning. There are grounds for thinking that Radlov 'emended' the text to suit his rationalization of this strange epithet, which faced him here at I, (3), 358 for the first time. The whole passage is built up on parallel similes, making a regular use of the particle *-dai* 'like'. The lines which precede I, (3), 358 ff. are:

353. *Aikirgam jolborstoi*
Ayu Bai jilkını küp jüröt,
Bos Adır tönun seyridäi
üstündö kudai teyridäi
Alman Bet jilkını aidap jüröt,

Thus there is a grouping of ll. 353-4, 355-7, 358-60: (retaining Radlov's punctuation). First comes the simile, then the subject, object, and verb. Clearly the pattern requires *kerädäi* [read *keridäi*] for *kerädä*. Not observing that *Jölönüs sari* [*da*] *keri* was, in epic Kirgiz, an epithet parallel and equivalent to *kök jal döböt börüdöi* in the preceding line, Radlov made *sari kerädäi* the place on which his wolf was prowling, and, ruining the pattern, 'emended' *kerädäi* to *kerädä*. Further, in view of *sari keräsi* at BM 1080, he is under suspicion of having changed *sari* to *sarida*, a suspicion which is strengthened by a couplet with the similes reversed in a later section of this group of poems by the same bardic school at (3); 1709 f. (Manas speaking):

*Jölönüs Sari keridäi*²⁵
*kök jal töböt börüdäi*²⁶
Alman Bet kalsaçı!

Radlov's attempt to put solid ground under the Wolf's feet is all the more surprising in that at 355 *Bos Adır tönun seyridäi* he had accepted a geographical feature as the basis for a simile for Alman Bet, translating thus: 'Gleich dem Vorsprung des Bos Adır': *seyir*, incidentally, is a near-synonym of *keri*; it means 'high grass-covered mountain-crest'. Working under pressure, Radlov never looked back.

A new element, however, has entered the discussion of this wolvisch epithet. Lines (3), 358 and 1710 have not the 'Wolf of the Muslims', a metaphor, but the famous *kök jal* 'blue-maned' with *börü-döi*, marking a simile. The basic symbol of the Wolf occurs in two different aspects: on the one hand with 'Blue-mane', going back to pagan times; on the other nicely adapted to suit pious taste as the 'Wolf of the Muslims'. One is therefore tempted to think that the simile *kök jal döböt börüdöi* preceded the metaphor *busurmandın börüsü*.

²⁵ Radlov now capitalizes *Sari*. His text also reads: *Jölönüş*. At Köskaman, 2500 f., *jölönüş sari ker ekän/kök jal töböt börü ekän*, Radlov renders: 'Ist ein mächtig gelbes Ross, ist ein Wolf mit blauer Mähne'. Here Radlov seems to have 'emended' to *ker* 'dark bay (of animal's coat)'. He obviously failed to recognize the couplet.

²⁶ Radlov *börüdäi*; cf. 358 *börüdöi*.

as a
 lbers
 late,
 -clot
 with
 anas.
 here
 et of
 iskön
 lov's
 nuldu
 s the
 not
 this

geo-
 and
 the
 la is

nd he
 the
 üs tö.
 ple to
 high
 la:

as ...
 milarly
 'Unser
 it 1080
 'Hier
 'whom

hich is

A further exploitation of the underlying symbol by a bard of the same school raises new problems (v, 1, (5), 1056 ff.):

kara kandū kök bittü
jölönüs sari Alman Bet,
kara kandū kök bittü
kök jal töbö Alman Bet: . . .

Radlov: 'Schwarz von Blut mit blauen Läusen, Alman Bet, der Bergegleiche, Schwarz von Blut mit blauen Läusen, Alman Bet der Hügelgleiche . . .'. In view of (3), 358 *kök jal döböt börüdöi* and (3), 1710 *kök jal töböt börüdäi*, (5), 1059 (*kök jal*) *töbö* 'hill' above is under suspicion of having been 'emended' from *töböt* 'male' to make 'Hügelgleiche' in order to balance 'Bergegleiche' from *jölönüs* 'small slope', 'low eminence'—with the complete suppression of *kök jal* at (5), 1059! But if one had seen no other contexts and if *jölönüs* (instead of *Jölönüs*) is correct, *jölönüs sari Alman Bet* and *kök jal töböt Alman Bet*³⁷ would balance each other as 'the Kite of the Hills, Alman Bet' and 'the Blue-maned He-Wolf, Alman Bet', taking *sari* as *sar-i* from *sar* II ' (black) kite'—which is excellent style. On the other hand it is poor epic style to liken heroes to low eminences (*jölönüs*; *töbö*) and above all in mountainous Kirgizia, in whose poetry such epithets as *today* 'huge as a mountain' are of the commonest.

An emended *kök jal töböt* for (5), 1059 accords well with the same phrase at (3), 358 and 1710: but *jölönüs sari* 'Kite of the Hills' challenges (3), 359 *Jölönüs sarida kerädäi* (as emended above) and 1709 *Jölönüs sari keridäi*.

Epithets in heroic poetry begin by being apt. As time passes the language and even the poetic style which they encapsulate tend to become archaic and so obscure. The less understood they become, the more exposed they are to reinterpretation, which in turn accelerates their disintegration. It has long been known, for example, that the Homeric bards and rhapsodes must have been puzzled by some of the formulae they inherited. Applying this knowledge to the present case one obtains the following evolutionary sequence:

I *jölönüs sari Alman Bet* 'Kite of the Hills', balancing the other predator according to the requirements of the parallelistic technique:³⁸ *kök jal döböt [Alman Bet]*. A metaphor.

II *jölönüs sari keridei* / [*Alman Bet*] 'like the yellowing (high, and, in spring, green) slopes of the (low) hill', reinterpreting *sari* as 'yellow' and introducing an inconsistency between 'green slope of a high mountain' and 'low eminence', and also between 'green' and 'yellow'. A simile.

³⁷ There is a shamanistic atmosphere in these images of a predator of the skies and a predator of the plains, linked: cf. the self-projections of Volkh Vseslav'ovich as a bright falcon of the sky and grey wolf of the land in the Russian *bylina* that bears his name (*Sbornik Kirshi Danilova*, vi). The series is 'correctly' completed by the pike of the water (cf. the *bylina* of Vol'ga and Mikula: *shchukoy-ryboyu khodit' emu v glubokikh moryakh, / ptitsy-sokolom letat' pod oboloka, / serym volkom ryskat' vo chistykh polyakh*); but SKD completes it with a discrepant non-predator—a dun aurochs with golden horns! In the 'Raid of Igor', Vseslav ranges as a wolf.

³⁸ cf. part I, 346.

III *Jölönüs* u
 introdu
 Manas
 To offi
 name w
 but a p
 hundre

If this evo
 possible: (i)
 Wolf' was ap
 it suited less
 material is co
 Kökëö; ⁴⁰ (ii)
 adjectivally as
 Bet was Chin
 contained me
Jölönüs too of
tömun seyridäi
 applied to Ma
 of Alman Bet
 bird-animal ep
 drawn into th
 ritual 'foster-

II *je*

agrees with t
 (vi) that *BM*
 applied to Ma
 to the *Manas*
 Another V

'Wolf-eyed, v
 Other epi

³⁹ As with *SK*
⁴¹ *Manas* and
 breasts of *Manas*
 (v, 1, (2), 1846 ff.)

⁴² 995; 1286

⁴³ At 995, R
Manas, der Tiger
 At 1286 and 129

f the same

ergëgleicho,
leicho . . .
örüdüi, (5),
'emended'
ergëgleicho
pression of
if jölönüs
öböt Alman
' Bet' and
'ii' (black)
yle to liken
us Kirgizia,
are of the

ie phrase at
ges (3), 359
keridäi.

no language
archaic and
they are to
It has long
must have
knowledge
e:

er predator
: 38 kök jal

l, in spring,
ellow' and
mountain'
' . A simile.

nd a predator
con of the sky
Danilova, vi).
a and Mikula:
loka, / scrym
on-predator—
lf.

III *Jölönüs too kerisi* [Manas] 'the high green slope of Mount Jölönüs', introducing *too* 'mountain' to gain height for both *keri* and the great Manas (cf. (3), 369 *tödaï Manas*), to whom the epithet is now transferred. To offset this gain there is loss: a mountain with an unconvincing name which means 'hill'. I have failed to trace a toponym 'Jölönüs'; but *a priori* I doubt whether it exists. If there is one, there will be hundreds: 39 and none is likely to be the name of a mountain.

If this evolutionary sequence is acceptable, several further conclusions are possible: (i) the parallelistic epithet 'Kite of the Hills'—'Blue-maned He-Wolf' was applied to Alman Bet before it was appropriated for Manas, whom it suited less well than Alman Bet, a figure who in the nineteenth-century material is conceived of as an eastern heathen converted to Islam by Er Kökçö; 40 (ii) in the phrase *jölönüs sari Alman Bet*, *sari* could have been taken adjectivally as 'yellow', thus starting or consolidating a tradition that Alman Bet was Chinese, in which case *jölönüs* would have had to become a self-contained metaphor, forerunner of the specific—and imaginary?—metaphor *Jölönüs too* of stage III, compare the topographical simile (3), 355 *Bos Adır tönnun seyridäi* 'like the lofty green crest of Bozadır'; (iii) that on being applied to Manas, the epithet was appropriately Islamized; (iv) that in view of Alman Bet's control over the weather and other shamanistic features, the bird-animal epithet suited him well yet tended to disintegrate the more he was drawn into the progressively Islamized *Manas*-cycle and subordinated to his ritual 'foster-brother' Manas; 41 (v) that the sequence

I *jölönüs sari* (metaphor)

II *jölönüs sari keridci* (simile) III *Jölönüs too kerisi*
(extended metaphor)

agrees with the notion that in oral heroic poetry metaphor precedes simile; (vi) that *BM*, all of whose occurrences of this Wolf-epithet are in form III and applied to Manas, shows also in this respect an advanced stage of assimilation to the *Manas*-cycle.

Another Wolf-epithet occurs thrice in *BM*, attached to Manas:

börü köstü kü murut,
kabilan tügan Er Manas 42

'Wolf-eyed, white-whiskered, tiger-born Er Manas'. 43
Other epithets of Manas are: *tentäk* 'Hothead', 'Madcap'. This may

39 As with *Sarı-bulak* 'Yellow Stream', cf. part I, 360.

40 Manas and Alman Bet become 'foster-brothers' in their young manhood: the withered breasts of Manas's mother Čakan marvellously flow again with milk so that she can suckle both (v, I, (2), 1846 ff.).

41 995; 1286; 1293. At 995, Radlov omits the length-mark on *kü*, but has it at 1286 and 1293.
42 At 995, Radlov unaccountably applies the first part of the formula to Koşoy: 'Kan Manas, der Tigergleiche, Zum Wolfäug'gen, zum graubärtigen, [sic comma] Helden Koschoy . . .'. At 1286 and 1293 he correctly attributes the couplet to Manas.

43 v, I, (2), 66 ff.

occur alone, and even in reciprocal extra-metrical apostrophes at the ends of lines, repeated, as in the remarkable exchange discussed below⁴⁴ between Manas and his armourer Tökör, whose corresponding apostrophic title is *darkan* 'artificer' (honorific).⁴⁵ *tentäk* may also be preceded by the epithets *asıl tügan* 'nobly born' (245) and *kabilan tügan* (287) or even by *kabilan* (456). *tentäk* is not exclusively the epithet of Manas, since Bok Murun, another young warrior, also bears it (526; 588), so that it is amusing at 826 to see him addressing Manas with the very words which old Koşoy had addressed to him (526; 588): *Akai tentäk tura tur!* 'Hold hard, Hothead!' *tentäk* is thus clearly an epithet appropriate to high-spirited young warriors. It seems that Sagymbay accounts for Manas the *tentäk* in his usual 'epic' manner by means of the story that Manas's mother had the heart of a mare which had died of a gyrating disease foisted on her, together with a genuine tiger's heart, to make a soup when she was pregnant.⁴⁶ *ékanaktai* 'tiny' (literally 'ell-long') is used not in order to dwarf the mighty Manas but to suggest the gigantic proportions of Joloy and his family, who utter it (once before 'Er Manas' 1798; thrice before *uruk kul* 'thief', i.e. 'cattle-thief', 1810, 1881, 1887; and once before the epithet *kan-kor*, 1916). *kan-kor* is problematic. *kankor* II = 'young warrior' and is frequently confused with *kankor* I 'bloodthirsty, blood-spiller', cf. Mongol *khongor*.⁴⁷ *kan-kor* is of infrequent occurrence in Radlov's texts.⁴⁸ On the other hand it suited the purposes of the twentieth-century bards to play *kankor* up with an emphasis on its bloodthirsty aspects.

The initial presentation of Manas in *BM* at 66-78 (as also elsewhere in the poem) is therefore rich in characterization through epithets. Before we leave these, it will help to focus them if we briefly compare a similar passage in another poem from the same school, v, I, (5), *Kös Kaman*, 802 ff. Manas's wife Kanikey, fearful for the fate of her lord, addresses Alman Bet at length in lines with the repeated extra-metrical apostrophe *ül* 'son'. *kaira tartıp keldiñbi, ül?* 'Have you returned, my son?' she asks. She then delivers a string of epithets (most of which are already known to the reader from *BM*, 65 ff.):

(5), 803 *kabilanım ai jarkın, ül,*
tokoido ayu bellängän, ül,
belästä jolbors baştangan, ül,
teskäi jakka kıştagan, ül,
koi bōrındai kara kan, ül,
oñ kolunan uştagan, ül,
Köt jagınan karasañ, ül,
kırk kişinin çay bar, ül,
bet jagınan karasañ, ül,
beş aidar tügü bar, ül,
kabilanım ai jarkın, ül,
kan.töröm amambi, ül?

⁴⁴ pp. 566 ff.⁴⁵ See below, p. 568 and n. 147.⁴⁶ See 'The birth of Manas', 234.⁴⁷ Yudakhin, *Slovar*, s.v.⁴⁸ It occurs once only in *BM*.

'My Tiger
 forest, O son,
 that winter
 O son, a cl
 him, O sor
 there are t
 radiance, C
 Although I'
 Despite th
 hand', an
 attributed
 but to Alm
 du den Ti
 Sohn'—an
 Sohn...'
 Mondesglar
 2nd pers. a
 Bet, since
 one looks I
 kişinin as
 the Forty
 is but one
 812 beş aid
 Sohn': bu
 = 'hair',
 transferred
 tügü we ha
 different s
 sheep, and
 leader of I
 epithets wi
 alone and
 the speake
 Turning
 among the
 the age of
 cf. 289, 5
 cf. *BM*, ju
 may also

⁴⁹ Apart
 a slip over at
⁵⁰ For la
⁵¹ cf. Yuc

the ends of
 14 between
 o is *darkan*
 s *asil tügan*.
 1. *tentäk* is
 ng warrior,
 addressing
 26; 588):
 an epithet
 y accounts
 story that
 ng disease
 when she
 n order to
 Joloy and
 a *uruk kul*
 ie epithet
 r' and is
 f. Mongol
 ' On the
 s to play

ere in the
 we leave
 assage in
 nas's wife
 h in lines
diybi, ül?
 f epithets

' My Tiger, dazzling radiance, O son, [his] face like that of the bear in the forest, O son, [his] head like that of the tiger on the mountain-spur, O son, [he] that winters on the sunless northern slope, O son, who clutched in his right hand, O son, a clot of black blood large as a sheep's liver, O son, if you look behind him, O son, there is the dust of forty men, O son, if you look ahead, O son, there are the five [different sorts of cattle-] coats, O son, my Tiger, dazzling radiance, O son, is my lord Khan safe and sound, O son?'

Although his text is impeccable here, Radlov has not understood the situation. Despite the parallels with *BM*, 65 ff., despite 808 *kolunan* 'in his (3rd pers.) hand', and despite the absence of the 2nd pers. possess. particle, Radlov attributed at least the first of these epithets not to Kanikey's adored Manas but to Alman Bet: 'Du, mein Tiger, glänzend bist du, Sohn, Der im Walde du den Tiger angriffst,⁴⁹ Sohn, Auf dem Hügel auch den Bars zwangst,⁵⁰ Sohn'—and then with a shift to the 3rd pers. 'Der im Schatten überwintert, Sohn...'—and then back again to the 2nd pers. apostrophe 'O mein Tiger, Mondesglanz, O Sohn, Ist mein Fürst bei gutem Wohlsein, Sohn?' The 2nd pers. at 809 *karasay* of course does not justify the attribution to Alman Bet; since the expression is impersonal: '... that man because of whom, if one looks behind, one sees the dust of forty men...'. Radlov renders *kirk kişinin* as 'von vierzig Leuten': but these 'forty people' are the *kirk čoro*, the Forty Companions of Manas, of whom Kanikey's interlocutor Alman Bet is but one, recognition of which fact would have prevented Radlov's errors. 812 *beş aidar tügü bar* is rendered by Radlov as 'Siehst du aber die fünf Schweife, Sohn': but the number 'five' is as little arbitrary as 'forty' at 810. *aydar* 1 = 'hair', 'coat' (of animals) and *tük* 1 2 = 'coat' (of animals) and in a transferred sense 3 'cattle'. There can be little doubt but that in *beş aidar tügü* we have a variant of the stock phrase *beş tülük* standing for the five different sorts of domesticated cattle: horses, large horned beasts, camels, sheep, and goats.⁵¹ Thus in the quatrain 809 ff. Manas is conceived of as the leader of his 'Forty' on a successful cattle-raid. Alman Bet shares some epithets with his foster-brother Manas, but this grand cluster is proper to Manas alone and especially, so one would think, when his admiring wife Kanikey is the speaker.

Turning to Er Koşoy, we note a more specific verbal correspondence among the epithets in *K* and *BM*. After the death of Kökötöy, who reached the age of 199 in *K* (289, 31), Koşoy is 'the father of the people' (299, 20; cf. 289, 5 of Kökötöy) and 'the oldest among the people' (299, 25 etc.): cf. *BM*, *jurt karısı* (814 etc.). An epithet concerned with the collar on a robe may also have occurred in the 'source', since echoes of it occur in both

⁴⁹ Apart from the lexical error with *bellängän* (see p. 544, n. 29, above), Radlov has made a slip over *ayu* 'bear'.

⁵⁰ For *başlangan* see p. 543, above.

⁵¹ cf. Yudakhin, op. cit., sub *tülük*.

Центр
 D
 Акте

405161

K and *BM*. At *K*, 299, 28, as one of a series of epithets, there is (Yash Aydar speaking):

*podobnyy vorotniku khalata,
podkove podobnyy Koshay . . .*⁵²

'like the collar of a robe, like a horse-shoe Koşoy'. Cf. *BM*, 534 ff. (Manas speaking):

*Andai debā Kan Koşoi aba,
tondun jakasın tüürüp
etäginän kiyübi?
agası ailda turup
inäsi işin biläbi?*

'Do not say so, venerable Khan Koşoy. Turning up the collar of one's cloak, does one put it on by the skirt? When the elder brother is in the house, shall the younger brother say what is to be done?'

In *BM*, Manas is saying that Koşoy as the senior must arrange the funeral horse-race: the idea of the collar and cloak is used dynamically and in a rather far-fetched way; whereas in *K*, Yash Aydar uses the epithet statically, as epithets are for the most part used in *K*.⁵³ The general idea seems to hang over both passages that old Koşoy is associated with what is right and proper. In *K* he 'fits' like the collar on a cloak, or the shoe on a horse's hoof; in *BM* he is the 'right person' to direct the games. (Yet, typically for *BM*, it is Manas who does so in the event.) This does not suffice for a reconstruction of the epithet; nor does what must be a reminiscence of the same epithet in the disordered Kazakh tale of *Er Köksü*, part prose, part verse. Here, Kosai is the son of Köksü, Khan of the Ten Nogay. To a maiden whom he is wooing, he gives a silken coat. The maiden asks 'When will you come back?' The young man answers: 'When the collar of the coat has become like (i.e. as small as) a thimble'.⁵⁴ The motif is not taken up in the sequel.

It is also possible that the lost 'collar' epithet may have had some connexion with the notion that Koşoy lived at the 'edge' or 'fringe' of the people (*BM*, 1099; 1649 *el četinä Koşoi bar*, see p. 558 f., below) since *şaka* 3 and *čet* overlap in meaning. A proverbial expression must also be allowed for.

Three bards, two of them Kirgiz, one a Kazakh, representing diverse branches of tradition during the 1860's, knew that Koşoy, young or old, had something to do with the collar of a robe. The memory of it was loosely held by a disintegrating epithet. Each felt obliged by tradition to allude to it, and each did the best he could for it.

Koşoy has a grand epithet, too, a purple patch that was evidently learned by heart. An attempt to reconstruct it in its 'ideal' form from extant material in *K*, *BM*, and other poems recorded by Radlov, seemed to demand two quatrains, each subdivided and varied by the parallelistic technique and with

⁵² The arrangement as verse is the writer's: Valikhanov set it as prose.

⁵³ See p. 565, below.

⁵⁴ *Şapanın şaqazınan oimaktai kalğanıda kelärmin*, Radlov, *Obraztsy*, III, 1870, 95.

a predor
purple p
In this w
being ta
been mis

The stru
the forti
of Turfa
Line 1:
beistin;
Line 2:
Lines 1
Acceptin
Radlov
of *bekip*
primarily
only see
'court',
who alti
Manchu
a parall
Turfan,
have pr
the ruine
which is
'palace
Bejinda
particip
Kirgiz p
1961) is
can assu
but the

⁵⁵ See
⁵⁷ One
attentions
'Sochinen
Otdel Éinc

pro is (Yash Aydar

BM, 534 ff. (Manas

llar of one's cloak,
in the house, shall

rrange the funeral
lly and in a rather
thet statically, as
lea seems to hang
s right and proper.
rse's hoof; in *BM*
ally for *BM*, it is
a reconstruction of
ame epithet in the
Here, Kosai is the
n he is wooing, he
ack? The young
o (i.e. as small as)

ve had some con-
or 'fringe' of the
below) since *saka* 3
also be allowed for.
presenting diverse
young or old, had
it was loosely held
to allude to it, and

evidently learned
m extant material
d to demand two
echnique and with
prose.

y, III, 1870, 95.

a predominance of alliteration within the line. Where a line of the postulated purple patch is supported by the tradition I give it with some argument below. In this way the reader can make up his mind as to its validity at sight without being taken through the laborious process of 'reconstruction'. English has been misused in order to suggest the content of lines of Kirgiz individually.

1. Of fortified Beijin
2. Er Koşoy opened the Gates;
3. Of the [i.e. its] Palace
4. Er Koşoy.....:
5. Of Turfan
6. Er Koşoy opened up the way;
7. Of the [i.e. its] restricted market
8. Er Koşoy... gave new life.

The structure of the epithet in its ideal form would seem to have been: first the fortified city of Beijin (Pekin) and its Palace; then the caravanserai town of Turfan and its market.

Line 1: *BM*, 27; 473; 1003; Radlov, v, II (*Joloi-kan*), 4837 *bekip kalgan beiştin*; cf. v, I, (2), 394 *bekip bir kalgan beiştin*.

Line 2: *BM*, 28; 474; 1004; I, (2), 395; II, 4838 *eşigin ačkan Er Koşoi*.

Lines 1 and 2: *K*, 296, 12 *k Ir-Kosayu kotory otkryl zapretnye dveri v raye*. Accepting *beiştin* (i.e. *beyiş-tin*) at its face value 'of Paradise', one notes that Radlov ('geschlossen', 'verschlossen') has missed the correct shade of meaning of *bekip* on the two occasions when he actually translates it. *beki-* means primarily 'strengthen', 'fortify'; the meaning 'bar', 'shut off', 'shut' is only secondary. *beiş* 'Paradise' is not congruent with 'Turfan', or with *sarai* 'court', 'palace', or with *bazar* 'market': nor is it consonant with Koşoy, who although he came to be associated in poetry with a holy war against the Manchu,⁵⁵ has no other specifically religious associations. Under *beiştin* (genit.) a parallel to 'Turfan' must be sought. Geographically, Bei-tin, north-west of Turfan, would suit well: but it is inconceivable that Kirgiz tradition should have preserved over so many centuries the old Chinese name of Beshbalk, the ruins of which lie east of the present Urumchi.⁵⁶ This leaves Beijin 'Pekin', which is nearer phonetically to *beiştin* and agrees particularly well with *sarai* 'palace'. It is more likely to have been in the explicitly genitival form *Beifindin* than the implicit genitival form *Beijin*. In *K*, Valikhanov relates the participial *zapretnye* 'forbidden' not to *ray* 'Paradise', (contra all the extant Kirgiz passages) but to *dveri* 'doors' (N.B. not 'gates'). *zapretnye* (ed. of 1961) is even further from *bekip* (which owing to the alliteration with *beiş* we can assume Valikhanov to have had before him) than is Radlov's 'geschlossen': but the edition of 1958 prints *zapertye* 'locked', which is nearer.⁵⁷ *eşigin*, acc.

⁵⁵ See pp. 554 ff., below.

⁵⁶ See 'Bishballk' in *Encyclopaedia of Islam*, second ed.

⁵⁷ Once again, one cannot feel quite certain that the edition of 1961, for all its painstaking attentions to Valikhanov's writings, gives what Valikhanov actually wrote. N. I. Veselovskiy, 'Sochineniya Chokana chingisovicha Valikhánova', *Zapiski Imperat. Russk. Geograf. Obshchestva, Otdel Etnograf.*, xxix, 1904, 217, reads *zapertyya*.

possessed of *esik* (modern *esik*) with the primary meaning 'door-flap of a yurt', looks incongruent with 'Pekin'. The normal epic word for the gate of a city is *kapka*, cf. the formulaic *altı kapka key Kokan* 'Six-gated Kokand the broad' (*BM*, 881: cf. the Homeric formula *Θήβης ἐπλατύλοιο*, *Iliad*, iv, 406—'Seven-gated Thebes'). Nevertheless, the meaning of *esik* has become generalized to 'door' and 'gate'. It suffices that the modern harmonized version of *Manas* reads at II, 155b *bir esigi Beefindin / kiin batıs karay açılğan* 'a western gate of Pekin was opened'.

Lines 3-4: *BM*, 457 *bailanıp kalğan saraidın / jolun jasagan Er Koşoi. sarai*, correctly remembered, has been erroneously inserted into the couplet that dealt with *bazar*, alliterating not on *s* (*sarai*) but on *b*: cf. *BM*, 29 f.; (2), 396 f. *bailanıp kalğan bazardın / jolun jasagan (açkan)*⁵⁸ *Er Koşoi*. One can be quite sure that the *sarai* was not *bailanıp* (lit. 'tied up', i.e. 'restricted': Radlov 'verschlossen', 'umschlossen'): but it would be idle to speculate here about the verbal modal in *s* that may have been linked with *sarai* in this line, or the action taken in respect of it by *Er Koşoy* (though it is likely to have been military).

Lines 5-6: *K*, 296, 12 *i otkryl ostanovivshiysya put' v Turfan. ostanovivshiysya* is a doublet from the next section in *K*: *k tomu Ir-Kosayu, kotory ostanovivshemusya bazaru dal novuyu zhizn'* where *ostanovivshemusya* 'stagnant' is congruent with *bazaru*. If we delete *ostanovivshiysya* before *put'*, *otkryl put'* 'opened a/the way' clearly corresponds to *BM*, 30; 476 *jolun jasagan* (cf. (2), 397 *jolun bir açkan*). Roads are opened to towns (including market towns), not to markets: and what is done to stagnant or restricted markets is to give them new life—*ostanovivshemusya bazaru dal novuyu zhizn'*. The bard or bards of v, I, (2) and *BM*, having lost 'Pekin' to 'Paradise' and then, consequentially, the second town of 'Turfan', were uncertain where the road had to be opened up to; as the text stands, it is to the market (twice) or to the palace (once). But, thanks to *K*, which remembers Turfan (albeit probably adapted to mean 'Uch Turfan'⁵⁹) and also that its market is 'stagnant' (Valikhanov's equivalent for *bailanıp*), it is possible to assign *jolun jasagan Er Koşoy* as l. 6 to a l. 5 naming Turfan. Which verbal modal, presumably with initial *t*, stood before *Turfan* it would again be idle to try to guess now.⁶⁰

Line 7, then, is automatically the alliterating *bailanıp kalğan bazardın* of *BM*, 29 f. and (2), 396, already quoted; and l. 8 stands (symbolically) as *dal novuyu zhizn' Er Koşoy*.

The grand epithet of *Er Koşoy* in modern Kirgiz orthography would stand roughly as follows, as far as it can be safely reconstructed:

1. *bekip kalğan Beifin[din]*
2. *esigin açkan Er Koşoy,*
3. *s..... kalğan saraydın*

⁵⁸ *jasagan* at *BM*, 30 must be emended to *jasagan* (cf. *BM*, 476; below). *açkan* at (2), 397 is taken from *esigin açkan* at 395.

⁵⁹ See part I, 356.

⁶⁰ Working together with bards, scholars of Kirgizia ought to be able to recapture it.

The lost orig
But if the ab
will have ha
the line. Su
such passage
not of quatr
of course a f
or not woul
Russian tran

v,

cf. further I

On wha
Paradise th
Beifin[din]

In the p
the epithet
to Islam, Al
the assistan
Alman Bet
huge as a c

'Thy voice

⁶¹ See part

⁶² See part

⁶³ 401 ber

Thus the only
corrupt.

⁶⁴ A comm

'door-flap of a yurt',
for the gate of a city
I Kokand the broad'
iad, iv, 406—'Seven-
ecome generalized to
zed version of *Manas*
an 'a western gate of

agan *Er Koşoi. sarai*,
the couplet that dealt
BM, 29 f.; (2), 396 f.
oi. One can be quite
restricted': Radlov
speculate here about
rai in this line, or the
likely to have been

fan. *ostanovivshiy*
u, *kotory ostanovivshe-*
ta 'stagnant' is con-
fore *put'*, *otkryl put'*
jolun jasagan (cf. (2),
uding market towns),
ted markets is to give
n'. The bard or bards
then, consequentially,
road had to be opened
r to the palace (once).
ably adapted to mean
(Valikhanov's equiva-
r *Koşoy* as l. 6 to a l. 5
initial *t*, stood before

kalgan bazardın of *BM*,
(symbolically) as *dal*

hography would stand
ed:

below). *ađkan* at (2), 397 is

able to recapture it.

4. *Er Koşoy*;
5. *t*. *kalgan Turfan[đın]*
6. *jolun jasagan Er Koşoy*,
7. *baylanıp kalgan bazardın*
8. [*dal novuyū zhizn'*] *Er Koşoy*.

The lost original of *K* sometimes used alliteration to link the lines of couplets.⁶¹ But if the above reconstruction is to any degree valid, the source of *K* and *BM* will have had memorable passages with a preponderance of alliteration within the line. Such passages actually occur in the poems recorded by Radlov. One such passage combines it with parallelistic structure, but in terms of couplets, not of quatrains as in the above reconstruction. Parallelistic quatrains were of course a feature of the original of *K*.⁶² Whether they used line-alliteration or not would be possible though difficult to determine from Valikhanov's Russian translation. Examples from Radlov are:

v, 1, (2), 413 *alasin ala kačpadım,*
kulasın kūa kačpadım,
jasagan! sā ne jastım?
küdröt! saga ne kıldım?

BM, 569 *Joloidun jolun bastı deit,*
Ağıştı attap kaştı deit,
Töştüktün tüböşün basıp öttü deit,
Koşoidun koinuna kirü kaştı deit.

cf. further *BM*, 640 ff. and 648 ff.; both are set pieces praising race-horses.

On what can *Koşoy's* wide reputation of 'having opened the Gates of Paradise that was barred?' have rested? And in what circumstances can *Beifin[đın]* have given way to *beištin*?

In the passage quoted above from Radlov, v, 1, (2), in which four lines of the epithet occur, soon after Alman Bet's ludicrously superficial conversion to Islam, Alman Bet addresses (the absent) *Koşoy* as a *kojo* 'hoja' and implores the assistance in battle of (*Koşoy's*?⁶³) angels. At first one might think that Alman Bet is addressing Allah: but the mention of 'On thy head the turban huge as a cauldron'⁶⁴ precludes it:

402 *čakırgan ünüy azandai, kojom!*
başında seldü kazandai, kojom!
berıştälär kölörsün!
arbaktarıñ jölösün!

'Thy voice summoning is as loud as the Call to Prayer, my Hoja! On thy head

⁶¹ See part 1, 345.

⁶² See part 1, 346 and 357.

⁶³ 401 *berıştärıñ* ought presumably to read *berıştälärıñ*, cf. *berışteler*, pl. of *berışte* 'angel'. Thus the only one of these two instances that has the 2nd pers. possess. (of *Koşoy*) seems to be corrupt.

⁶⁴ A commonplace for heads, helmets, etc.

thy turban is huge as a cauldron, my Hoja! May angels bear [thee? me?] up; may the spirits of thy ancestors aid [thee? me?]'⁶⁵

It was therefore reasonable of Mrs. Nora Chadwick at the time when she was writing to infer that Koşoy 'had taken the lead in adopting Mohammedanism'.⁶⁶ On the basis of an unpublished study in Frunze, however, which deals with the intrusion into epic poetry of the historic Rising of Jaŋır-kojo (Dzhekhangyr, Jahāngīr, etc.) over the period 1822-8, Professor V. M. Zhirmunskiy has characterized Koşoy's opening the Gates of Paradise as an Islamized version of the widespread Turkic motif of a hero's penetrating into the Other World; and he came to the further conclusion that Koşoy had his own tradition of a great raid to the east before it was assimilated to the *Manas* cycle.⁶⁷ This last agrees well with the inferences from verbal examination of the grand epithet presented here.

It is possible to go farther. In his brief account of Jaŋır's insurrection, Valikhanov makes several statements of interest to us. Jaŋır was the hereditary Hoja of Kashgar; and his agents, who were often exiled Kashgaris like himself, were very active disseminating propaganda for the *gazat* or 'holy war', as, for example, by public recitals of the deeds of Abū Muslim,⁶⁸ whereby they so fostered the cult of *ghāzīs* and *shahīds*—dedicated Champions of the Faith who would assure themselves of a short cut to Paradise—that the Muslim youth of Central Asia were in a frenzy to imitate them.⁶⁹ As a favourite hero of legend with an established reputation of raiding towards Turfan and perhaps Peking, Koşoy was well suited to be set parallel to Jaŋır, who raided and temporarily occupied the Chinese-ruled cities of Kashgar, Yarkand, and Khotan. As already hinted above,⁷⁰ it is probable that 'Turfan' in Koşoy's tradition was reinterpreted as 'Uch-Turfan' to suit the direction of Jaŋır's attacks. Yet it is only as a *ghāzī* or *shahīd* skilfully adopted by pro-Jaŋır propagandists that Koşoy enters the religious sphere in epic and 'opens the Gates of Paradise that was barred'. For otherwise Koşoy was a burly hero who, even in his old age, could, for example, outwrestle the gigantic glutton Joloy.⁷¹ Another suggestive statement by Valikhanov is that after the restoration of Chinese power in the area (though with diminished prestige), the Chinese had placed customs gates across the routes into Kashgar and Yarkand many miles out, chiefly in order to punish Kokand for its part in the Rising. Those merchants who were allowed

⁶⁵ In his *Slovar'* Yudakhin quotes and translates sub *fol.* our lines 403-4: but wholly admirable as his dictionary otherwise is, he sometimes forgets the poetic contexts from which he has excerpted his instances. In 403-4 he supplies the unexpressed object in brackets as *tebya* 'thee'. Radlov has 'deine Engel'.

⁶⁶ H. M. and N. K. Chadwick, *The growth of literature*, III, 1040, 37.

⁶⁷ In the symposium *Kirgizskiy geroicheskiy épos Manas*, Moscow, 1901, 133 ff. and 154. The unpublished study is entitled '*Dzhekhangir-khodzha v épose i istorii*' and is by A. A. Valitova.

⁶⁸ Valikhanov, op. cit., II, 316 f.

⁶⁹ *ibid.*

⁷⁰ p. 552.

⁷¹ *BM*, 1246 ff.

in were escorte
This gives sub
market', disc
the restricted t
that they decid
to this part of
stimulated in t
doctored epic s
it all was that d

Since garble
probable that
legendary Koşo
must be examin
(i) *K*, 296, 14 *K*
syna Belereka, c
rosstat', on, khre
'When the inf
birth he was of
Koşoy, terrified

Nes-kara is
heroic song.

(ii) (a) 2

(Context: Man
Bok Murun to i
him through the
battle between
Kashgar? cf. 30
Murun's poem l

⁷² Valikhanov,
p. 552.

⁷⁴ II, 323.

⁷⁵ For initial 'M

⁷⁶ *kurča* for *kara*

⁷⁷ The query af
Kojo [i.e. Koyo?], d
adapted Cyrillic =

oo? mo?] up;

when she was
medanism'.⁶⁶
deals with the
Dzhekhangyr,
rnmunskiy has
mized version
Other World;
tradition of a
le.⁶⁷ This last
grand epithet.

s insurrection,
the hereditary
is like himself,
holy war', as,
hereby they so
the Faith who
uslim youth of
hero of legend
perhaps Pekin,
nd temporarily
Khotan. As
a tradition was
attacks. Yet it
pagandists that
of Paradise that
in his old age,
ther suggestive
so power in the
l customs gates
chiefly in order
ho were allowed

103-4: but wholly
ontexts from which
ject in brackets as

33 ff. and 154. The
by A. A. Valitova.

in were escorted in convoy to the emporium and back under strict guard.⁷² This gives substance to the expression *bailanyp kalgan bazar* 'the restricted market', discussed above,⁷³ and Valikhanov's further statement that in 1829 the restricted trade in Chinese tea became so intolerable to the men of Kokand that they decided to open the way to trade rifle in hand,⁷⁴ lends further colour to this part of Koşoy's epithet. Trade, Islam, propaganda, and heroic ethos stimulated in the cities by readings of Abū Muslim and among the tribes by doctored epic songs, all went hand in hand: but the dominant outlook behind it all was that of the merchants and hojas of Kashgar (in exile), and of Kokand.

Since garbled reflections of Jāḡır's raids occur in both *K* and *BM*, it is probable that their common source, too, had a passage which presented the legendary Koşoy as close to those historical events. The relevant allusions must be examined in detail.

(i) *K*, 296, 14 *Kogda nevernyy khan Mez-Kara*⁷⁵ *v temmitsu zatochil Dzhangyrova syna Belereka, chto byl rodom iz khodzhey, kogda nikto iz musul'man ne otvazhilsya vosstat', on, khrabryy Koshay, khrabrost' yu ustrashil i osvobodil togo khodzu.*

'When the infidel Khan Mez-kara incarcerated Jāḡır's son Belerek because by birth he was of the Hojas, when none of the Muslims dared to rise up, he, brave Koşoy, terrified them with his valour and set free that Hoja.'

Nes-kara is one of the regular Sino-Kalmak antagonists of the 'Nogay' in heroic song.

(ii) (a) *BM*, 438 *kapır karča keldi dep,*⁷⁶
*Abila Jangır (?) Kan Koyom*⁷⁷
mltik-minün tars koidu,
kaldıragın salımp
Kaldai ėga uruštu,
beldämėisin salımp
Mejin ėga uruštu,
Kara baštü tün kötörüp
kapırdın kan Nes-Kara
karsıldaşıp uruštu . . .

(Context: Manas has cruelly murdered Jaima Kökül, the messenger sent by Bok Murun to invite him to the Feast, has summoned his Forty to range with him through the Naryn valley and, looking out from Mount Kebäs[ti], spies a battle between Muslims and Infidels before 'the six-gated stronghold'—i.e. Kashgar? cf: 392—and intervenes victoriously, thus having an aristoia in Bok Murun's poem before it has really started.) 'He came up against the Infidel,

⁷² Valikhanov, op. cit., II, 322.

⁷³ p. 552.

⁷⁴ II, 323.

⁷⁵ For initial 'M' see also Radlov, v, II (*Joloi-kan*), 4740 *Mis Kara*.

⁷⁶ *karča* for *karš*?

⁷⁷ The query after *Jangır* is Radlov's. He omits 'Abila Jāḡır' in his translation: 'Kan Kojo [i.e. Koyo I], der mächt'ge Held'! The text requires emendation to *Kan Koşox* in Radlov's adapted Cyrillic = modern *kan Koşom*. Radlov's *Kojoş* = modern *Koyom*. See n. 78.

it is said, Abila[i]⁷⁸ Jaŋır the Khan, my Hoja, fired off his rifle, the Kalday [high-ranking Sino-Kalmak officer] having donned his corslet joined combat, the Mejin⁷⁹ [another high Sino-Kalmak rank] having put on his breast-plate joined combat, the Khan of the Infidel Nes-kara raising his Black-Head Standard thunderously joined combat

(b) 1021 *Kapırdın kanı Nes-Kara,
anı kamap jatkanda
jaŋıs ülu Bilärik
kapır karmap ketkändä
altı kapka çarbakta
katü uruş salgamn
jaŋıs ülu Bilärik
anda kücüm bir taidı.*

(Text: *jaŋıs* 'one and only' clearly in error for *Jaŋır* at 1023 and 1027, cf. *K*, 296, 15 *Dzhangyrova syna Belereka*. Did Radlov 'emend' or was the tradition already at fault? *jaŋıs* [modern *jaŋgız*] is a variant of *jalgız* 'unique'. Radlov translates 'sein [Nes-kara's!] einz'ger'. Context: Koşoy has been asked to take on Joloy in the Wrestling Match at the Games. He declines, pleading old age, and gives a catalogue of encounters in which, he alleges, his strength had suddenly left him—*anda kücüm bir taidı*, cf. l. 1028 above. One instance was his struggle with Nes-kara.) 'When the Khan of the Infidels, Nes-kara, was keeping him (namely—emended) Jaŋır's son Bilärik in prison, and I came to grips with that infidel at the six-gated walled city (Kashgar?), I put up a great fight (for?) Jaŋır's son Bilärik, (but) then my strength suddenly failed me.'

We know from *K* (loc. cit.) that Koşoy was victorious on this occasion and liberated Belerek/Bilärik from Mes-kara/Nes-kara. Thus Koşoy's catalogue of his own 'defeats' (a rare phenomenon in heroic poetry) is a sly form of boasting, suggesting that his strength left him only after victory. When Koşoy at last consents to face Joloy, of course Koşoy wins.

(c) 1652 *Andan arı sen barsaŋ;
Abilai Jaŋır Kan Kojon,
andan bata alıp kait!*

(Context: Manas sends Aju Bai to the smith Tökör⁸⁰ with instructions to deliver threats or ask for blessings at various places en route according to the hero who lives there.) 'If you ride on from there [you will find] your Hoja, Abilai Jaŋır-kan. After receiving his blessing go on again.'

⁷⁸ 'Abila' sic. Cf. 1653 'Abilai' [sic] *Jaŋır Kan Kojon*, where Radlov has $\eta = f$ correctly in *Koşon*. See n. 77.

⁷⁹ Radlov of course knew this rank well: yet he renders *mejin* as 'Pekin'! 'Zog zum Kampfe selbst nach Peking', which is absurd. Subsequently in this action (*Jaŋır Kan Kojon* [Radlov: *Koyo*] is mentioned thrice (455; 457; 461, in the last instance in connexion with his blessing). It would take up too much space here to try to disentangle Radlov's misconceptions.

⁸⁰ See p. 566 f., below.

Compare further:
(d)

(Context: Koşoy Khans, stepped forward stepping proudly from (The 'Khan Hoja From (a) and (Hiorde of the Ka amalgamated with happen, since Kirg recorded in 1862, later executed) appeared *jaŋıs* for *Jaŋır*. fought Nes-kara lamely, to Koşoy catalogue of 'defeats' with that same Ne

It is well to take and Jaŋır in heroic (active 1822-8), is historical or near-purely legendary. In other words, the known from living not history, setting this continuum before 'Nogay', has been of the assimilation of Koşoy's fictive Bilärik (*BM*)/Be. In his valuable compiled from re C. Imbault-Huart the latter end of and Samuq; Ab states further that the Khan of Ko

Compare further :

(d) 1111 *Kan abası Er-Koşoi,*
balbanga tüsmök boldu deit.
Basıp bara jatkanda,
Kan Kojomdon bat'aly

(Context: Koşoy finally consents to face Joloy.) 'Er Koşoy, senior among Khans, stepped forward to take part in the wrestling-match. And on his stepping proudly forward, he received the blessing from my Khan Hoja . . .'
 (The 'Khan Hoja' is presumably Jajır, cf. passage (c) above.)

From (a) and (c) it appears that Ablay (1717-81), the Khan of the Middle Horde of the Kazakhs and celebrated victor over the Kalmak, has been amalgamated with Jajır. Once accurate knowledge had faded this could easily happen, since Kirgiz has no direct equivalent for 'and'.⁸¹ If Radlov's bard, recorded in 1862, could no longer keep Ablay and Jajır (captured 1828, and later executed) apart, it is possible that he was responsible for the error 1023 *jajır* for *Jajır*. Nevertheless, *BM*, like *K*, preserves the datum that Koşoy fought Nes-kara in order to free Jajır's son Bilärik: *K* appends it, rather lamely, to Koşoy's string of epithets; *BM* works it into Koşoy's cunning catalogue of 'defeats', but only after we have been shown how Manas dealt with that same Nes-kara in the presence of Jajır near the beginning of the poem!

It is well to take stock of what occurred on this naming together of Koşoy and Jajır in heroic song. Jajır, an historical figure of the previous generation (active 1822-8), is placed on the same footing as Koşoy, who, whatever his historical or near-historical antecedents many centuries ago,⁸² had become a purely legendary figure, governed by the 'laws' not of history but of poetry. In other words, the mythic or legendary past and the recent historical past known from living memory have been merged into a continuum, with poetry, not history, setting its stamp upon it. Not only have Koşoy and Jajır met in this continuum but also Nes-kara, a legendary Sino-Kalmak antagonist of the 'Nogay', has been drawn in on the opposite side. The nature of this process of the assimilation of history to poetry is further brought out by examination of Koşoy's fictive exploit in Jajır's Rising, namely his liberation of Jajır's son Bilärik (*BM*)/Belerek (*K*). Historically, it seems, Jajır had no such son. In his valuable translation of Wei Yüan's treatise on Jajır's insurrection compiled from reports by the Chinese officials concerned with its suppression, C. Imbault-Huart gives the genealogy of the Hojas of Kashgar in an appendix, the latter end of which furnishes these data: Boronidu had two sons, Abdul and Samuq; Abdul's son was Jajır; ⁸³ Jajır's son was Burzuk. ⁸⁴ The treatise states further that after the defeat of the insurgents, the Chinese requested the Khan of Kokand to surrender Jajır's descendants and supporters. This

⁸¹ *meneñ* after a noun means primarily 'with'.
⁸² Zhirmunskiy, art. cit. p. 167.
⁸³ *Recueil de documents sur l'Asie Centrale*, Paris, 1881, 62.
⁸⁴ *ibid.* and p. 50.

ife, the Kalday
 joined combat,
 his breast-plate
 his Black-Head

1023 and 1027,
 and' or was the
 'jalgız' unique'.
 Koşoy has been
 as. He declines,
 h, he alleges, his
 028 above. One
 of the Infidels,
 Bilärik in prison,
 city (Kashgar?),
 men my strength

this occasion and
 Koşoy's catalogue
 is a sly form of
 victory. When

th instructions to
 according to the
 find] your Hoja,

or has $\eta = f$ correctly

'Pekin'1 'Zog zum
 ion (Jajır) Kan Kojo
 in connexion with his
 dlov's misconceptions.

the Khan declined to do, on the ground that the laws of Islam forbade the surrender of sons or grandsons of hojas. The treatise then records that since the children of Janir were not to be feared, the Emperor decreed that the matter was not to be pursued. A high Chinese official in the area, however, dispatched envoys to try to seize Janir's son Burzuk, then six years of age; but the Emperor, having learned of this, commanded him not to stir up new strife.⁸⁵ This implies that Janir had at least two children, but there is no evidence here that he had a son with any other name than 'Burzuk'.⁸⁶ On the other hand, Janir had a nephew, whose name, transliterated from Chinese with a French convention, Imbault-Huart gives as *Sa mou'hann*. Since the treatise goes on to say that this person had assumed the title of 'Khan', his name was presumably 'Samuq-khan'.⁸⁷ On the recapture of Kashgar by the Chinese in 1827, this Samuq was taken prisoner. Thus although Burzuk, son of Janir, was still alive, and as the last of the Hojas was a marked man and in 1862 was even made nominal head of the Dungan Rising,⁸⁸ our two heroic poems *K* (pre-1857) and *BM* (1862), (i) give him a name 'Bilärik', (ii) attribute to him an incarceration by the Chinese that may have been his cousin Samuq's, and (iii) have this composite renamed figure rescued by a legendary hero Koşoy from the equally legendary Nes-kara. If the passion of the Kirgiz for heroic song encouraged them thus to indulge in make-believe when the elders were possessed of the historical facts, these tribesmen must have been easy prey for the propagandists of the mercantile cities and their militant 'ulamā'—and all the more so if we include the Kirgiz lust for booty, so well nourished by the poetic tradition.

To conclude the subject of Koşoy's epithets. The line formula *el četinā Koşoi bar* 'Koşoy lives at the margin of the people' occurs twice in *BM* (1099; 1649);⁸⁹ and *K*, 296, 8 locates Koşoy on the Ulutau Mountains, some 1,000 km. north-west of Lake Issyk Kul' but still well within the frontiers of present-day

⁸⁵ p. 50.

⁸⁶ In a footnote on Burzuk, Imbault-Huart records that when in 1862 the Dungans in turn rose against the Manchus, Burzuk was invited, as the last representative of the family of Hojas, to lead it, and that Muḥammad Ya'qūb was thus one of his followers (p. 50). Burzuk can have been little more than a nominal religious leader, since in his account of the Rising in *Loise Blätter aus Sibirien*, second ed., II, 1893, 303 ff., Radlov does not mention him. Wen-djang Chu, *The Moslem rebellion in north-west China, 1862-1878*, The Hague, 1966, 163, refers to him as 'Buzurg Khan': 'Buzurg Khan, a descendant of the former khoja ruling house of Kashgar, came into Sinkiang from . . . Khokand in January 1865. He made himself the king of Kashgar. Before long he was replaced by Yakooob Beg, his chief of staff'. (After this was written, *The life of Yakooob Beg*. . . *Ameer of Kashgar*, London, 1878, by D. C. Boulger, came into my hands. Boulger based himself chiefly on the official report of Sir Douglas Forsyth on his embassy to Kashgar in 1873-4. Boulger uses the form 'Buzurg': he gives Janir a father 'Sarimsak', a grandfather 'Barhanuddin', and three sons, two of whom are 'Buzurg' and 'Wali Khan', leader of an earlier expedition against Kashgar. It is much to be hoped that an expert historian will be able to disentangle these complexities. Boulger presents Buzurg as a classic example how an utterly profligate prince can be replaced by an energetic adviser—Ya'qūb.)

⁸⁷ Janir's paternal uncle Samuq is given no descendants in the genealogy: was his name preserved in that of Janir's (maternal?) nephew?

⁸⁸ It was found necessary to refer to the Dungan Rising in part I of this study, 364 f.

⁸⁹ The 'people' were presumably 'Nogay', i.e. idealized Kirgiz.

Kazakhstan, an epithet which w situates Er Koş

The epithet complex than tl

In *K*, Dzhul dizes on the salī khan, whose cap life and blood (293, 9 ff.). Litt oddly vacillates Kalmak.⁹² On t

... there is th leaving no beard of the Russians

'Even though l On the other h indeed a Sino-K

(Context: the horses at the er Joloy from [thro and gleaming s committed outr. In the Kirgiz ep Kalmak jabber, jabber "Altai!

⁹⁰ The question

⁹¹ See part I, p.

⁹² In the long l appropriately a favo

Islam forbade the records that since decreed that the he area, however, six years of age; not to stir up new but there is no 'Bürzük'.⁸⁶ On ted from Chinese 'kann'. Since the le of 'Khan'; his f Kashgar by the ough Burzük, son arked man and in s our two heroic rik'; (ii) attribute s cousin Samuq's, ndary hero Koşoy 'Kirgiz for heroic n the elders were een easy prey for 'ulamā'—and all nourished by the

formula *el četindä* rice in *BM* (1099; is, some 1,000 km. ers of present-day

the Dungans in turn of the family of Hojas, 20). Burzük can have Rising in *Loze Blätter* Wen-djang Chu. The era to him as 'Buzurg of Kashgar, came into g of Kashgar. Before as written, *The life of* came into my hands. th on his embassy to father 'Sarimsak', a ' and 'Wali Khan', at an expert historian as a classic example —Ya'qūb.)

alogy: was his name

is study, 364 f.

Kazakhstan, and inhabited by Kazakh.⁸⁰ Thus *BM*, perhaps in adopting an epithet which would already have been apt enough in Kazakh, by implication situates Er Koşoy just inside the Kirgiz lands—'at the margin of the people'.

The epithets of some of the more important remaining heroes are less complex than those of Manas and Koşoy, and can be dealt with more briefly.

In *K*, Dzhulay,⁸¹ i.e. Joloy, is characterized at 293, 2 ff. as he 'who nomadizes on the salinae of Butanyn-Saz, that plays hazard every day, brave infidel khan, whose cap is huge as a black cauldron, who has power over all that have life and blood'. What follows makes it clear that Dzhulay is a Kalmak (293, 9 ff.). Little of this agrees with the characteristics of Joloy in *BM*. *BM* oddly vacillates in its presentation between Joloy as a Russian and Joloy as a Kalmak.⁸² On the one hand there are two passages which make him a Russian:

141 *kapırdın jurtı bar ekän,*
bulčuy eti bukadai,
eginä sakal koibogon,
erdinän murut albagan,
orustun kam čoy Joloi . . .

there is the land of the infidel; he whose muscle is as tough as a bull's, leaving no beard on his chin, not removing his moustaches from his lips, a khan of the Russians is Giant Joloy.

1536 *Orusta bolso kan edi . . .*

Čoy Joloi kan aitti dei . . .

Even though he is a khan among the Russians . . . Giant Joloy spoke . . . On the other hand there are many passages that make him a Kalmak, and indeed a Sino-Kalmak. Two will suffice.

1565 *kapırdın kam čoy Joloi,*

Kanıkaidan kabar jetkän soy,
agar altın ak kümüs,
Joloi talap alğan soy,
altailagan köp kapır
namıs kılıp ketkän soy . . .

(Context: the skirmish between Manas's followers and Joloy's sons over their horses at the end of the race.) 'When news reached the infidel Khan Giant Joloy from [through the cries of] "Kangay!" and he had plundered pale gold and gleaming silver, and the mob of unbelievers shouting "Altai!" had committed outrage . . .'

In the Kirgiz epic, 'Kangay!' is the war-cry of the Kalmak, and 'Altai!' is Kalmak jabber, cf. *BM*, 1515 *altailagan kalmaktan* ' . . . of the Kalmak that jabber "Altai!"'. And at Alman Bet's suggestion Manas's men don Mongol

⁸⁰ The question arises whether Koşoy was originally a Kazakh and not a Kirgiz hero.

⁸¹ See part I, p. 376 and n. 183.

⁸² In the long heroic song *Joloi-kan* (Radlov, v, 11), Joloy is a 'Nogay' and in this case appropriately a favourite hero of the Kirgiz tribe of the Solto, among whom the song was collected.

gear in order to spy on Joloy, a pointless stratagem if Joloy is not a 'Mongol', i.e. Kalmak:

1725 *körünböi kürmön kiyäli!*
topu tonop alalı!

'Disguising ourselves, let us don sleeveless [Mongol] jackets, let us lay hands on some [Mongol] embroidered skull-caps . . .'⁹³ Otherwise, Joloy in *BM* has the epithet *çoy*, 'great' (twice above), and *töday* = *today* 'mountainous' (1067, etc.).

With *orustan* (144) supported by *orusta* (1536) it is difficult to impugn Radlov's text: yet the text would become tolerable if we could read *oirot-* (of a Mongol confederacy) for *orus-* (Russian). According to this school of bards, Alman Bet by origin was an Oiroi, and his first utterance in this cycle is the pseudo-Kalmak jabber 'Altai! Altai!' (v, 1, (2), 68).⁹⁴ *Orus* and *Oiroi* were linked in this bard's mind by alliteration, cf. 1451 *Orustap kelät bir atın / Oiroitop kelät bir atın*. But there may well be some other reason for the intrusion of 'Russian' into Joloy's attributes.⁹⁵

Another traditional antagonist of the Nogay is Koçur-bay (*K*, Kunurbay). In *K* Koçur-bay, surprisingly, is the 'large-nosed' Chinese warrior named 'the Proud' (290, 39 f.), otherwise 'the (gos)hawk-nosed Chinese warrior' (292, 7); a lord to whom the Nogay are to pay tribute. In *BM*, Koçur-bay is a shade less magnificent. Here, too, his nose claims attention. He is '*kir murundü*' (152; 776; 1270), literally 'with nose sheer as a mountain-spine (*kir*)': but *kir murunduu* is used in a transferred sense to designate a variety of golden eagle, and it is no doubt from this that the epithet for a nose is taken.⁹⁶ Thus in *BM*, too, Koçur-bay's nose recalls the beak of a bird of prey. But whereas we may be sure that in *K* his nose is what we call 'aquiline', we are informed by Yudakhin in his admirable *Slovar'* that *kir murunduu* implies possession of a straight, non-aquiline nose (*bez gorbinki*). Just which variety of golden eagle (*bürküt*) struck the Kirgiz bards as having a straight beak, and why, is unlikely to be discovered by a Western scholar, since Kirgiz falconers of the old school distinguish as many as 65 species, sub-species, and varieties.⁹⁷ If we look for the Kirgiz original of Valikhanov's *yastrebinonosomu* (292, 7), it therefore cannot be *kir murunduu*: but it could be *kuş murunduu*, with *kuş*, generically 'bird of prey'.⁹⁸ At *BM*, 152 etc. *kir murundü* fills a half-line, the other half is taken up by *kızıl kös* (152 'red-eyed') or by *kıza kös* (776; 1270

⁹³ cf. the utterance of Joloy's wife Saykal at 1802: (*Manas*) *kürmön tonop kiptir, / topo tonop salıptır*: *topu* indicates a Mongol cap in these heroic songs, despite the Persian origin of the word (Radlov: 'Mongolenkäpsel').

⁹⁴ In this poem, Alman Bet, slaughtering his Oiroi compatriots, piles up their *topu* and *kürmön* mountain-high (432 f.), see also previous note.

⁹⁵ Did the Kirgiz perceive a resemblance between him and some hearty Russian frontier types?

⁹⁶ Yudakhin, sub *kir*.

⁹⁷ Yudakhin, sub *bürküt*. The Kirgiz *bürküt* (Russian *berkut*) is famous in the annals of falconry.

⁹⁸ Yudakhin does not cite *murun*-compounds for *tuygun* 'white goshawk' or *tunjur* 'goshawk'.

'winking').⁹⁹ *kütailardin Koçur*, which also occurs and a full line are *Bai—1. (3). 53.*

followed by 4879 conceived of as t occupied by Jayr bay's overlordship of Uch-Turfan.¹⁰²

Like Joloy, the bears his name (B world on his wing escape on the bac clearly a heroized direct allusion on

'... a warrior becoming to this we youngest of nine s allusion is to his fi eight good-for-not was past child-bea escaped from the adventure.' *K* na to race) in transl Bok Murun request as such to come ar according to the Portion in Old Iri Master of Ceremon tion not the best. *Manas* as the activ the stage is set fo

⁹⁹ cf. Radlov's not correct reading later.

¹⁰⁰ *Slovar'*: *küz* *küz* half-closed lids than a

¹⁰¹ *buru*, literally

¹⁰² See *Er-Töshtak* de P. Boratav et L. Ba

¹⁰³ See my article

¹⁰⁴ For analogies of

¹⁰⁵ cf. D. G. Maitla

Compendium of histo 'Cuts of meat'

¹⁰⁷ See K. Jackson 21 f., the *curadmir* or

is not a 'Mongol',

let us lay hands

(twice above), and

difficult to impugn
could read *oirot-* (of
this school of bards,
in this cycle is the
Drus and *Oirot* were
lap kelät bir atın /
son for the intrusion

bay (K, Kunurbay).
ese warrior named
d Chinese warrior
BM, Kogur-bay is a
ntion. He is. 'kur
is a mountain-spine
designate a variety
for a nose is taken.⁹⁶
bird of prey. But
aquiline', we are
murunduu implies
st which variety of
straight beak, and
nce Kirgiz falconers
es, and varieties.⁹⁷
onosomu (292, 7), it
urunduu, with *kuš*;
fills a half-line, the
kaza kös (776; 1270.

tonop kipir, / *topo tonop*
the Persian origin of the

plea up their *topu* and

hearty Russian frontier

famous in the annals of

'*ork' or 'unfur' goshawk*'.

'winking').⁹⁹ *kaza* is surely correct.¹⁰⁰ The second line of the epithet is regularly *kitailardin Kogur Bai* (153; 777; 1271) 'Kogur-bay lord of the Chinese', which also occurs in isolation (1583): (In another poem of this group a half line and a full line are amalgamated to make the line *Kitaidin kur murundū Kogur Bai*—1; (3), 53. *Joloi-kan* 4878 has in one line: *kur murundū Kogur Bai* followed by 4879 *Kitailardin Kogur Bai*.) More specifically, Kogur-bay is conceived of as the ruler of Kashgar and Yarkand, two of the three cities occupied by Janir.¹⁰¹ (150; 1269). In *K*, in removing the Nogay from Kogur-bay's overlordship, Bok Murun seems to be leaving the Chinese-held region of Uch-Turfan.¹⁰²

Like Joloy, the hero Er Töstük appears in a self-contained heroic song that bears his name (Radlov, v, III). The theme of his penetration into the Underworld on his winged steed *Čal-kuyruk* to recover his purloined 'soul', and his escape on the back of his friend the World Eagle, is widely known.¹⁰³ It is clearly a heroized tale of shamanistic origin. The epithets in *K*, however, have direct allusion only to the circumstances of his marvellous birth: ¹⁰⁴ 297, 38 '... a warrior born thanks to the long prayers of many well-wishers and coming to this world as the result of the pleas of those well-wishers ... the youngest of nine sons of an aged father, valiant Töstük, beloved of God'. The allusion is to his father Eleman's long prayers for a worthy son to make up for eight good-for-nothings at a time when his wife had either long been barren or was past child-bearing.¹⁰⁵ Töstük was 'beloved of God' else he would not have escaped from the Khan of the Underworld, an indirect allusion to his great adventure. *K* names Töstük's famous *tulpar* (which Bok Murun invites him to race) in translation as *plamyakhvost* 'Flame-tail' (297, 41) = *Čal-kuyruk*. Bok Murun requests Töstük through his emissary to be Lord of the Feast, and as such to come and choose the best cut off the roast—the Brisket of Honour—according to the well-attested ancient Turkic custom,¹⁰⁶ cf. the Champion's Portion in Old Irish heroic narrative.¹⁰⁷ Manas, too, is invited to be Lord and Master of Ceremonies, but he is to choose merely 'a dainty piece'—by implication not the best. Thus Töstük is to be imagined as the passive President and Manas as the active Master of Ceremonies. Given Manas's turbulent character, the stage is set for a clash between him and Töstük: but *K* breaks off long

⁹⁹ cf. Radlov 'roth von Augen' (152), 'schießung'go' (776; 1270). Having accepted the correct reading later, Radlov failed to collate.

¹⁰⁰ *Slorur*: *küz kis*: 'wink' sub *kis*: 'press'. Thus the impression intended is rather one of half-closed lids than a squint, or even slanting eyes.

¹⁰¹ *buru*: literally 'screw', 'twist' (Radlov: 'herrscht in').
¹⁰² See *Er-Töstük, le géant des steppes. Trad. du kirghiz par P. Boratav, introduction et notes de P. Boratav et L. Huzin, Paris, 1965.*

¹⁰³ See my article 'The birth of Manas', 226.
¹⁰⁴ For analogies of this traditional motif see 'The birth of Manas', 226.

¹⁰⁵ cf. D. G. Maitland-Muller, *A study and translation of the first book of the first volume of the 'Compendium of histories' by Rasid al-Din ...*, Ph.D. thesis (London, 1957), ch. vii, p. 27.

¹⁰⁶ 'Cuts of meat'.
¹⁰⁷ See K. Jackson, *The oldest Irish tradition: a window on the Iron Age*, Cambridge, 1964, 21 f., the *curadmír* or 'Champion's Portion', carved by the champion for himself.

before we could come to it. Yet it is possible that there was no clash, since one tradition makes Er Töstük the father of the foundling Bok Murun,¹⁰⁸ and Manas could then have accepted Er Töstük's precedence. There is no trace of this in *BM*. Here Manas defers to Koşoy's seniority but is at length prevailed upon to arrange the horse-race (though Bok Murun arranges the other games): and there is no mention of heroes' portions. Like all the other heroes in *BM*, Töstük is overshadowed by Manas. His epithets allude mainly to his exploit in entering and leaving the Underworld. Yet the first composite epithet agrees fairly well with one at *K*, 297, 40, *Mladshemu iz devyati synovey starogo otsa, bogom lyubimomu khrabromu T.* (translated above), and

BM, 89 *toqus ül kenjäsi*¹⁰⁹
kudaidın süigön mindäsi . . .

'The youngest of nine sons, he is a man beloved of God' = 1034 f. continuing

91 *Eläman baidın balası*
Er Töstük . . .

'son of Eleman-bay, Er Töstük . . .' = 702 f.; 941 f.; 1036-7 *jerge tüskön Er Töstük* 'Er Töstük who descended into the earth'.

Lines 702 f. are preceded by

698 *Jer astınan çikkani*
jeti kündör bold'elä,
arık çäp salıp tur,
uyatınan koşup tur,
Eläman baidın balası,
Er Töstüktün çal-kuiruk . . .

Line 698: 'Of him who emerged from under the ground . . . (cf. Radlov 'Der tief in die Erd hinabstieg'). 699: where he had been for seven days . . . (cf. Sayakbay's version, 332, 8. Kenjeke speaking: *Sırtın Töstük ketti ele, / Ketkenine tak bıyl / Jeti ılga jetti ele* 'This year makes it seven years since brave T. went away'). 700 is perhaps contentious. Radlov renders 'Der sich mager hat gelaufen'—thus *arık* I 'lean', *çap*-IX 'gallop', 'race' (typically of horses): the construction, however, precludes l. 700 from referring to Töstük's steed *Çal-kuyruk* (703); so Radlov appears to have applied *çap* to Töstük. But the collocation *arık* I with *çap*-IX (according to Radlov 'to gallop oneself lean') is not cited by Yudakhin, whereas *arık* II with *çap*-X is well-attested under both words in the sense 'to dig an irrigation-ditch'. Thus, tentatively, 700 'He dug a water-channel'. 701 'For shame he sang a lament (like a woman)', i.e. he broke down (cf. Radlov 'Der vor Scham zu singen anfang').¹¹⁰ This must refer to a traditional episode in the *Töstük* legend in

¹⁰⁸ The version of Sayakbay Karalaev, ed. *Zh. Tashtemirov*, Frunze, 1956, 31 ff.; Boratav, op. cit., 49 ff.

¹⁰⁹ *kenjäsi*: Radlov again uses *j* (modern *y*) inconsistently in *Kenjäci*, cf. 1034 *Kenjäci*, his normal practice.

¹¹⁰ *koş* 'join', 'pair', has the transferred meaning of composing (improvising) laments for the dead by women only. Yudakhin's *Slovar* notes: *muzhchine ne položeno*.

which the hero
This is *Çal-kuy*
lake, and *Töstük*
leading Kazak
Bazin commen
apparaissent d
l'épopée origine
commentators,
information the
the allusion in
them as linked
drain the lake a
Helpers swallow
causes the water
that he should
earlier stage of
Two contex

In (a), *jerin*
to indicate a n
recurs at 965 J
'Da war *Töstük*
965 'Sch ich m
these two pass
'He-who-does-
fast that he sc
Radlov's text
Prodigious Hel
epithet approp
let-the-gazelle-
'*Gazella subgut*
been assumed t

¹¹¹ Sayakbay.

¹¹² Boratav, op.

¹¹³ In another
ground under the c
But the hole is not
hole'.

¹¹⁴ cf. Boratav.

no clash, since one Bok Murun,¹⁰⁸ and There is no trace of at length prevailed as the other games): other heroes in *BM*, only to his exploit in the epithet agrees *provey starogo otsa*,

1034 f. continuing

1036-7. *jerge tüskön*

(cf. Radlov 'Der seven days . . . (cf. *Töstük ketti éle*, / seven years since renders 'Der sich 'race' (typically from referring to have applied *éap* to Radlov 'to gallop with *éap* - x is well-tion-ditch'. Thus, he sang a lament for Scham zu singen the *Töstük* legend in

1856, 31 ff.; Boratav,

cf. 1034 *Kenpäci*, his

(improvising) laments for

which the hero's steed dives into a lake to fetch the Cauldron with Forty Lugs. This is Čal-kuyruk's supreme test. His blood appears on the surface of the lake, and *Töstük* gives him up for dead and laments him.¹¹¹ The prose of the leading Kazakh version breaks into verse at this point. M. Boratav and M. Bazin comment here: 'Ces lamentations sur le sort de *Tchal-Kouyrouk* apparaissent dans plusieurs versions; elles faisaient peut-être partie de l'épopée originelle'.¹¹² The evidence of this epithet in *BM*, not cited by the commentators, suggests that 'peut-être' is too cautious, and it adds the information that, in his despair, *Töstük* keened like a woman. Recognition of the allusion in l. 701 may help to trace the allusion in l. 700, if we can take them as linked; for in that case the water-channel could have been dug to drain the lake and save Čal-kuyruk. In some versions one of *Töstük's* Prodigious Helpers swallows the water of the lake, and in Sayakbay's version *Töstük* causes the water to be dispersed by lashing it with his whip. It is just as likely that he should have drained it away with an *arık*. It would accord with an earlier stage of his legend that he could drain a lake without help.¹¹³

Two contexts in which *Töstük* is named are problematic:

(a) 925 *Töstük jer astınan täptir*
jerin sekirtpäş degän bar ekän . . .

(b) 942 *Er Töstük töngö čıgıp tir*
tügörötö karap tir,
Jer astınan täp tir,
Kazatar mergän karap tir :

In (a), *jerin sekirtpäş* should be in quotation marks and have initial capitals to indicate a name-epithet governed by *degän* 'thus named'. The expression recurs at 965 *Jerin sekirtpäş karasam*; but Radlov's translations vary: 925 f. 'Da war *Töstük*, den im Sprunge Niemand überholte unterhalb der Erde', and 965 'Seh ich meinen tapfern Springer'. It seems that Radlov has not collated these two passages only 40 lines apart. *jerin sekirtpäş*, as it stands, means 'He-who-does-not-make-the-ground-beneath-him-leap', i.e. one who runs so fast that he scarcely touches the ground. But caution is advised in accepting Radlov's text at this point, since in Sayakbay's version one of *Töstük's* Prodigious Helpers, he who aids him in winning the foot-race, bears the name-epithet appropriate to the fleetest of men: *seyren sekirtpes* 'He-who-does-not-let-the-gazelle-leap' (pp. 132 ff.) (*seyren* = Kaz. *jayran*, Asiatic Russ. *dzheyran*, '*Gazella subgutturosa*').¹¹⁴ This in turn raises a nice problem. It has hitherto been assumed that the bard from whom Radlov recorded *Töstük* in 1869 had,

¹¹¹ Sayakbay, 243 ff.; Boratav, 202 ff.

¹¹² Boratav, op. cit., n. 375.

¹¹³ In another episode in several versions *Töstük* or one of his women digs a hole in the ground under the cradle of Čoynkulak's brat so that *Töstük* can hide and prick him with an awl. But the hole is not an *arık*. Cf. Radlov's *Töşük*, 149 *ordu kast: Er Töşük*, from or *kaz-* 'dig a hole'.

¹¹⁴ cf. Boratav, op. cit., 122, 'Qui-no-laisse-échapper-le-Chamois'.

in the fatigue of which Radlov wrote,¹¹⁵ hurried past many of Töstük's Underworld experiences, including the Marriage-tests set by the Lord of the Underworld and surmounted by the hero thanks only to the Prodigious Helpers he had befriended; ¹¹⁶ although the heroes who penetrate into the Underworld in more primitive hero-tales recorded, for example, by Schiefner,¹¹⁷ perform their exploits without Prodigious Helpers, and at most with the assistance of a comrade-in-arms. So far as they are no longer genuinely shamanistic, 'Prodigious Helpers' come from that rather boring source of narrative the international folk-tale. Whatever the bard of *BM* understood by *jerin*,¹¹⁸ he seems to be alluding to a version of *Töstük* other than the source presupposed by M. Boratav and M. Bazin.¹¹⁹ Understood or misunderstood—*Jerin/Jeyren Sekirtpes* was found by Töstük in the Underworld, like *Kazatar mergän*, whom Töstük summons more as a protective spirit to help him win the race.¹²⁰ Hero-names in *mergen* 'marksman' are typical of the more primitive hero-tales; ¹²¹ and protective spirits go better with Turkic hero-tales than do Prodigious Helpers. It is again disturbing that Radlov renders *Kazatar* as 'Gemsenschütze, -jäger' ('chamois-hunter'), since *kaz-atar* would mean not 'chamois-' but 'goose-hunter' (*kaz* 'goose'; *atar* from *at-* 'shoot').¹²² However, the role of *Kazatar mergän* invites inspection. 'Er Töstük climbed a hill,¹²³ gazed all around ¹²⁴ and saw *Kazatar* the Marksman, whom he had found in the Underworld' (942-5). On being invoked by Töstük as his radiant lord, *Kazatar* appears and puts Joloy's old wife, who is winning, out of the race, first by fettering her ¹²⁵ and then by squirting poison at her.¹²⁶ Bare-faced fowls, recalling the practices of the English aristocracy at Newmarket in the 1820's ¹²⁷ are a stock motif in both foot- and horse-races in Kirgiz epic poetry. In the foot-race in Sayakbay's *Töstük*, for example, the Hag-with-Seven-Heads waylays Töstük's Helper *Jeyren-sekirtpes* and sends him to sleep with magic dust as we may infer Joloy's wife had sent *Jerin Sekirtpäs* to sleep here, since *Kazatar* says (965) *Jerin sekirtpäs karam / uktap tura kalgambı* 'When I see J. is he still asleep?'

¹¹⁵ v, p. xvii f.

¹¹⁶ Sayakbay, 220 f. = Boratav, op. cit., 182 ff.

¹¹⁷ S. Schiefner, *Heldensagen der minussinischen Tataren*, St. Petersburg, 1859.

¹¹⁸ In his *Versuch eines Wörterbuchs der Türk-Dialekte*, Radlov cites no forms of *seyren* with *-in*: all have *-an* or *-en*. The presumption is that Radlov, and possibly his bard, took *jerin* in *jerin sekirtpäs* as *jer-i-n* (accus. possessed of *jer* 'ground').

¹¹⁹ op. cit., 22 ff.

¹²⁰ *BM*, 946 ff.

¹²¹ Schiefner, op. cit., see index of tales: 'Ai Mirgän und Aidölei' etc. etc.

¹²² A possible solution of this difficulty is to suppose that in Radlov's manuscript 'Gemsenschütze, -jäger' stood loosely in the margin against *jerin sekirtpäs* understood as *seyren s.* and that 'Gänseschütze, -jäger' ('goose-hunter') stood against *Kazatar*; and then that either Radlov or an amanuensis substituted the former German word for the latter. But a further disturbing element is Radlov's rendering 945 'den guten Gemsenschützen', suggesting Kirg. *kas* 'good', cf. *kas baatırlar* 'doughty warriors' (*Yudakhin, Slovar*, sub *kas*).

¹²³ *töy*, modern *döy*.

¹²⁴ Radlov *tögörötö*, i.e. *tögöröktö*.

¹²⁵ Radlov renders *bogonu* as 'Knopf': it is surely from *boogo* 'fetters'.

¹²⁶ Radlov reverses the roles in the poison-squirting, making *Kazatar* the victim, despite the clear outcome that it is Joloy's wife who is laid out with poison (950 f. and 958 ff.).

¹²⁷ Pückler-Muskau, *Briefe eines Verstorbenen*, letter of 19 October 1826.

Scrutiny of that they celeb help of his *tulp* that he had a f into an 'epic' worthy of that

It is not pos if *K* was ever g there are furthe close study, but required on the

In *K* there i to give the key besides being 'Baymurza was Yash-Aydar,¹²⁹ ride the steed 'tuffed', as perl action reference of epithet may graphical featur the *biy* are 'pc signs of 'having and gardens are characters like I may be added U that never show Alpay Mamet (2; the sap of putric implying, accord

By comparis impression of a or denied to the and other well-k that the two or same tribe withi

¹²⁸ Outstanding when 'lengthening' technical 'decadence

¹²⁹ In *BM*, the h_g v, 1, (2), 1144 Jaima *Kökül jaš ul*. It lool, *jaš* (i.e. *jaš* 'young')

¹³⁰ 294, 15 refers

¹³¹ 289, 14, varie

¹³² 296, 26; 47.

many of Töstük's Under-
by the Lord of the
to the Prodigious Helpers
into the Underworld
chiefner,¹¹⁷ perform their
the assistance of a com-
amanistic, 'Prodigious
ative the international
erin,¹¹⁸ he seems to be
supposed by M. Boratav
Jeyren *Schirtpes* was
nergän, whom Töstük
the race.¹²⁰ Hero-names
five hero-tales; ¹²¹ and
do Prodigious Helpers.
Gemsens-schütze, -jäger'
chamois-' but 'goose-
over, the role of *Kazatar*
gazed all around ¹²⁴
the Underworld' (942-5).
zatar appears and puts
by fettering her ¹²⁵ and
recalling the practices of
are a stock motif in
foot-race in Sayakbay's
plays: Töstük's Helper
as we may infer Joloy's
Kazatar says (965) *Jerin*
J. is he still asleep?'

cit., 162 ff.

Petersburg, 1859.

writes no forms of *seyren* with
possibly his bard, took *jerin* in

etc. etc.

Ballor's manuscript 'Gemsens-
is understood as *seyren* s. and
zatar; and then that either
for the latter. But a further
schützen', suggesting *Kirg-*
'sub kas).

zatar's
feters'.

Kazatar the victim, despite the
(959 f. and 958 ff.).

October 1826.

Scrutiny of Töstük's and his friends' epithets in *BM* thus shows not only that they celebrate his exploit of penetrating into the Underworld with the help of his *tulpar* Čal-kuyruk and returning from it by divine favour, but also that he had a famous runner and a Marksman before his hero-tale was inflated into an 'epic' by means of devices from the international folk-tale scarcely worthy of that epic form.¹²⁶

It is not possible to compare the epithets of Alman Bet in *K* and *BM*, since if *K* was ever going to name him it broke off before doing so. In *K* and *BM* there are further epithets peculiar to the one or the other that would reward close study, but they fall outside the scope of this comparison. Yet a word is required on the different styles in the use of epithets exhibited by *K* and *BM*.

In *K* there is a marked tendency to keep to one epithet, and for this epithet to give the key to the bearer's role or station. It was seen that Bok Murun, besides being 'young' was 'born to power': he in fact assumed power. Baymurza was 'son of a wealthy father' and that was all: he was thrust aside. Yash-Aydar,¹²⁹ first as Kökötöy's and then Bok Murun's herald privileged to ride the steed Maniker, is frequently the impersonal *gustochuprinnyj* 'thick-tufted', as perhaps befits one in a subservient position; ¹³⁰ yet when he is in action reference is occasionally made to his subtlety and eloquence. This style of epithet may also persist when a people, or a social type, or cattle, or topographical features are referred to: the Nogay are 'teeming black as night'; the *biy* are 'possessed of sagging paunches' (hence rich); *murza* show the signs of 'having drunk much mead'; ¹³¹ cattle are 'well-covered on the ribs'; and gardens are 'branchy'.¹³² It has been seen, nevertheless, that important characters like Koşoy, Manas, and Joloy have composite epithets. To these may be added Urbé (Ürbü) (296, 36), Kokeche (Kökčö) (291, 36: 'a warrior that never showed his back since birth', with his pedigree), Bagysh (297, 22), Alpay Mamet (297, 49 'son of a stinking little old man who all his life milked the sap of putrid birch, the warrior Alpay Mamet nicknamed "Grey Hare"', implying, according to the commentators, extreme hunger).

By comparison, the use of epithets in *BM* is less disciplined, giving the impression of a greater degree of the 'automatism' that has been attributed or denied to the use of the epithet in the Homeric poems, the *Nibelungenlied*, and other well-known epics. It should be of some interest for these debates that the two oral heroic poems *K* and *BM*, recorded presumably from the same tribe within six years of one another, vary appreciably in their stylistic

¹²⁶ Outstanding bards though they were, Sagymbay and Sayakbay tended to lack restraint when 'lengthening' their performances for scholars, so that it is not improper to speak of technical 'decadence' in connexion with some of their work.

¹²⁹ In *BM*, the herald's name is *Jaima kökül* (284; 315). But in another poem of this school, V, I, (2), 1144 *Jaima Kökül* is one of Manas's Forty, referred to by the identical line: *Jaima Kökül jas ül*. It looks as though in the heat of improvisation the bard of *BM* could recall only *jas* (i.e. *jas* 'young') in Yash-Aydar's name.

¹³⁰ 294, 15 refers to him as a slave, cf. 294, 25.

¹³¹ 289, 14, varied presumably in a parallelistic quatrain.

¹³² 296, 26; 47.

use of epithets. The greater discipline of *K* may well accord with its bard's loftier conception of a great Khan's court and manner of life, not to mention possible reflections of contact with learned men,¹³³ suggesting that of the two poets he stood nearer to the tribal centre, where a higher tone prevailed.

A last item of comparison before an attempt is made to draw general conclusions is that of set altercations between followers and lords, passages imbued with the 'heroic' ethos, of which *K* and *BM* provide several examples. Owing partly to the incomplete state of *K*, no specific comparison is possible. The comparison is therefore typological.

In *K*, the herald Yash-Aydar Chora¹³⁴ is bidden by Kōkötōy to take Maniker and ride from one end of the Nogay to the other to announce his approaching death (289, 8). Having succeeded Kōkötōy and taken the Nogay to the Upper Irtysh, Bok Murun in turn claims the services of Yash-Aydar and commands him to summon the heroes to the Feast with their racers (294, 15). 'Bok Murun born-for power, my lord!' answers Yash-Aydar, 'I shall not go to your warriors, nor shall I go for their racers. I have no wish to die at the hands of your mighty ones!' ¹³⁵ He then reminds Bok Murun how they tended their flocks and herds together as boys and complains that as a reward for the pranks they shared he is now to be treated as a slave.¹³⁶ His father and mother could die while he was summoning the heroes from far and wide. Bok Murun's reply is that he will go himself but on his return he will put Yash-Aydar and his parents up as prizes. Yash-Aydar goes home in fear and trembling. He returns and tells Bok Murun that he does not understand a joke and asks for the best horse. Bok Murun of course knows what Yash-Aydar is after, offers him the pick of the herd and gives a set eulogy of one particular horse (295, 12 ff.). But Yash-Aydar declines. 'Rather would I die at your hands . . . Beneath you, noble lord, is the steed Maniker: give me Maniker and I will go! Upon you, noble lord, is dazzling chain-mail: give it me and I will don it!' Yash-Aydar gains his—the appointed—end.

In *BM*, there is a similar test of will and ethos between Manas and his armourer Tōkōr, who comes similarly into 'danger' of his lord. Hard-pressed and wounded at the height of the battle with Joloy, Alman Bet accuses Manas of coming late to the fray. Manas's reply is to send a messenger to distant Talas to demand his broken sword from Tōkōr, who was welding it and reforging his corslet. If Tōkōr has not finished his work after the five months he has had it in hand he is to be put to death forthwith (1609 ff.).¹³⁷ The bard avoids the folly of keeping the battle going until Tōkōr could appear (some

¹³³ See part I, 375 ff.

¹³⁴ i.e. *čoro* 'member of a lord's comitatus'.

¹³⁵ Yash-Aydar perhaps has a presentiment of death at the hands of Manas, cf. Jaima Kōkūl's fate in *BM* at 315 ff.

¹³⁶ cf. p. 565, n. 130.

¹³⁷ Radlov—or an amanuensis—has obscured the if-clauses in his translation, since ll. 1626-7 end in question marks, when commas would give the correct sense in German. 1625 should end in a period as in the original.

weeks' journey
and we accom-
work is done ar
telling him the
return and info
whereupon the

"Have you m
Tōkōr the artifi
forged your cors
Not enduring t
Not enduring t
enduring the b
Not enduring t
it, Hothead. S
edge with ven
Thrust ¹⁴³ it wh
This exchan
Later on in *B*

¹³⁸ In European
'told' to the herc
Perceval/Parzival'

¹³⁹ Radlov: 'i
esoteric smiths' lan

¹⁴⁰ One suspect.

¹⁴¹ *kühē silte*
mit deinen Augen

weeks' journey there and back). He simply drops it with the change of scene and we accompany the messenger to Talas. Tökör tells the messenger that his work is done and that he will deliver it to 'the Hothead' himself, and after telling him the nature of the sword—1671 *kılıştın jaiym aitkan soy*¹³⁸—he will return and inform Manas's wife Kanikey. Tökör mounts and rides to Manas, whereupon the following exchange takes place between lord and man:

1680 'kıldıñb' elä kılıştı, darkan?
 saktıñb' elä sötti, darkan?'
 Tökör usta jöp aitti:
 'Kıldım elä kılıştı, tentäk,
 saktım elä sötti, tentäk,
 kılıştın jaiym aitain, tentäk,
 küüm äidabai, tentäk,
 jaman janım küinaldı, tentäk,
 ögösünö äidabai, tentäk,
 elü ögöm joyuldu, tentäk,
 soguna äidabai, tentäk,
 som balkalar joyuldu, tentäk,
 basuna äidabai, tentäk,
 baldarım barı jädadı, tentäk,
 mizi sarı bolsun dep,
 mizin üga sugardım, tentäk,
 özüñdü-karañ şiltäbä, tentäk,
 katü uruşka salıñar, tentäk.'

"Have you made my sword, Master? Have you forged my corslet, Master?" Tökör the artificer gave answer: "I have made your sword, Hothead. I have forged your corslet, Hothead. I will tell you the nature of the sword, Hothead. Not enduring the forging, Hothead, my spirit was much tormented, Hothead. Not enduring the filing, Hothead, fifty files were shattered, Hothead. Not enduring the blows, Hothead, my sledge-hammers were shattered, Hothead. Not enduring the pressure, my 'Children' (bellows? ¹³⁹) could not stand up to it, Hothead. So that the blade should be yellow,¹⁴⁰ I thought, I tempered the edge with venom,¹⁴¹ Hothead. Do not swing it at yourself,¹⁴² Hothead! Thrust¹⁴³ it where strife is hard, Hothead!"

This exchange is imbued with a heroic ethos worthy of any epic tradition. Later on in *BM* there is even a classic formulation of the ethical bonds that

¹³⁸ In European heroic narratives important swords can have a 'nature' which has to be 'told' to the hero by or from the smith—sometimes a secret or magical 'nature' as with Percival/Parzival's sword, made by the smith Trebuchet.

¹³⁹ Radlov: 'ist mein Blasobalg zerrissen'. Unsupported by Yūdakhin: but it could be esoteric smiths' language.

¹⁴⁰ One suspects a transferred meaning here.

¹⁴¹ See p. 568, n. 146.

¹⁴² *kılıç şiltä*: 'brandish a sword'; *karap* implies direction. Cf. Radlov: 'Zwinkero nicht mit deinen Augen'.
¹⁴³ Radlov: 'du gehst'.

unite a lord and his men, such as one finds in the Old English Finnsburg Fragment or in the spirited Old Welsh *Gododdin*.¹⁴⁴ The basic formula will suffice (Manas speaking):

2143 *söltü jüdim sen ücün, čorom,*
*sayışıp ölgün men ücün, čorom!*¹⁴⁵
kılıştı jüdim sen ücün, čorom,
kurılışkın men ücün, čorom!

'I heaped up corslets for your sakes, comrades, die amid the lance-thrusts for my sake, comrades! I heaped up swords for your sakes, comrades, perish together for my sake, comrades!'

Of this passage and the exchange between Manas and his armourer, it would be no stylistic contradiction to say that they are passages in which epic poetry—a protean form—assumes the quality of lyrical drama. The titles *darkan* and *tentük* following the cadences of each line, mark it as a lyrical passage within the Kirgiz epic tradition, and such passages can be very high-flown. Tökör has come to Manas to account for his work in person. Just as Yash-Aydar as a loyal herald was never really in danger of being put up as a prize by Bok Murun, so Tökör as a loyal armourer was never really in danger of being put to death by Manas. An older man, he makes his point with easy familiarity, addressing his young lord as 'Hothead' and warning him against wounding himself with such a deadly weapon, since, like some famous swords of Germanic heroic poetry, its edge has been baited with snake-venom during the forging.¹⁴⁶ Moreover Tökör receives the title of *darkan*¹⁴⁷ that is due to him and is later rewarded

¹⁴⁴ In both poems there is talk of heroes fighting in requital of their lords' mead.

¹⁴⁵ Radlov: *sayışıp*.

¹⁴⁶ See C. M. Bowra, *Heroic poetry*, second ed., London, 1952, 149 f.; A. T. Hatto, 'Snake-swords and Boar-helm in *Beowulf*', *English Studies*, xxxviii, 1957, 145 ff. *uu* means not only 'poison' but also 'reptile venom', cf. *Slovar* sub *uu*: *aşdaardıñ uusuna altıms kündöp ülagan* (of a sword) 'he steeped it for sixty days in dragon's venom'.

¹⁴⁷ *darkan* occurs only as a title in *BM*. When Tökör is otherwise referred to it is always by means of *usta* (from the Persian) 'artificer' (e.g. 1621; 1628; 1646; 1664 f.). At first sight, it might be taken for 'sir', a generalized and democratized descendant of *tarḡan*, the high title known from the Turkic runic inscriptions. Radlov, however, translates as 'Künstler' and in his *Versuch eines Wörterbuches* renders it as 'Schmied'. In his *Slovar*, Yudakhin gives the primary meaning as 'smith', and the secondary transferred meaning as 'respected', 'famed', 'honourable'. Armourers were highly favoured and privileged in armies, hence, it is alleged, the transferred meaning. It seems perilous to take up a point of Kirgiz lexicography with its most distinguished master: but there is at least one link missing here. If we turn to Kazakh, we find *darḡan* master: (1) 'expert, master'; (2) 'honest; friendly, considerate man' (B. Shnitnikov, *Kazakh-English dictionary*, The Hague, 1966). But sense (1) is confined to south-east Kazakhstan, i.e. the part bordering on Kirgizia. Karakalp. *darḡan* 'free, untrammelled' (N. A. Baskakov, *Karakalpaksko-russkiy slovar*, Moscow, 1958). Uzb. *darkhon* means 'exempt (from obligations), privileged' (Akabirov, Magrufov, and Khodzhaḡhanov, *Uzbeksko-russkiy slovar*, Moscow, 1959). Tatar *tarkhan* 'free, subordinated to none' is derived by the lexicographers from the historic 'high rank known in the Tatar Khanates' (Akademiya Nauk SSSR, Kazanskiy Institut Yazyka, Literaturny i Istorii, *Tatarsko-russkiy slovar*, Moscow, 1966). From this it appears that there has been a semantic evolution from *tarḡan*, with its implication of high rank, in a generalized and even democratized sense parallel in some respects to that of Med. Latin *senior* and Middle High German *hërre* 'lord'. The meanings 'free, privileged as a lord; gentlemanly; honourable sir'

for his work I
 Joloy-kan: a
 armourer occu
 does not cite &
 for é in *BM*.
 would be: 'V
 In this case, I
 what more ren

Good servit
 and Tökör can
 generous treat
 the loyal sooth
 before the seco
 him after Targ
 to the jaw with

The conclu
 and *BM* are as

K and *BM*
 nevertheless ha
 accession of Be
 feast, the prom
 where the Feas
 surrounding he
 further had so
 structured epithe
 corresponding s
 decadence; it
 brought in the
 traditional hero
 result of propa
 Kashgaris. Sin
 the Bugu tribe

emerge. Only th
 discrepant. Rath
 preferable to bring
 no in correspond
 meanings (1) "ep
 phonetic form". T
 the Turkic substra
 smith, honourable
 Mongol form and of

¹⁴⁸ *BM*, 1757 ff.

¹⁴⁹ *dalı jak*. TI
 the Far East.

¹⁵⁰ Though it is
 measure: 'Du Hu

for his work by Manas with the gift of 40 horses and the two daughters of Joloy-kun: a high reward.¹⁴⁸ A further very suggestive trait of this master-armourer occurs at 2168 *solok usta dārkan* / *Batar Manas fakirat*. Yudakhin does not cite *solok* in his *Slovar*. But it has been seen that *s* frequently occurs for *é* in *BM*. Reading *éolok* 'mutilated in leg or hand' for *solok*, the sense would be: 'Warrior Manas summoned his lame(d) smith, the noble artificer'. In this case, Tökör would join the lamed Germanic smith Weland and, somewhat more remotely, Hephaistos.

Good servitors—one might almost call them good vassals—like Yash-Aydar and Tökör can depend on good lords like Bok Murun and Manas to accord them generous treatment. The point is underlined by the treatment meted out to the loyal soothsayer Targil Tas by the bad lord Joloy. Joloy consults Targil Tas before the second clash with Manas, and, disliking the repeated warnings given him after Targil has burned and 'read' sheep's shoulder-blades,¹⁴⁹ cleaves him to the jaw with the words 'Die a thousand deaths'.¹⁵⁰

The conclusions to be drawn from the two parts of this comparison of *K* and *BM* are as follows.

K and *BM* derive from an oral, hence fluid common source in verse, which nevertheless had some set narrative data, e.g. the death of Kōkötöy, the accession of Bok Murun, the announcement by the latter of a great funeral feast, the promulgation of a Plan for the nomadizing of his people to the venue where the Feast and Games were to be held, his invitation, with threats, to the surrounding heroes in a Catalogue... (thus far *K*). The common source further had some memorable and memorizable passages, e.g. intricately constructed epithets; it was in process of assimilation to the *Manas* cycle with a corresponding scanting of Bok Murun's role, and hence in a state of incipient decadence; it was imbued with an ethos easily recognized as 'heroic'; and it brought in the recent uprising of Janir-kojo (1822-8) by placing him and the traditional hero Er Koşoy on the same historico-legendary plane, possibly as a result of propagandist manipulation of Kirgiz heroic poetry by insurrectionist Kashgaris. Since *K* (very probably) and *BM* (certainly) were recorded from the Bugu tribe of the Kirgiz it is likely that the immediate common source

emerge. Only the south-east Kazakh and Kirgiz meanings 'expert, artificer, smith' are discrepant. Rather than accept the semantic development implied by Yudakhin it seems preferable to bring the Mongol *darkhan* into the picture, as Sir Harold Bailey first suggested to me in correspondence. Dr. C. R. Bawden notes: 'In modern Mongol, *darkhan* either has two meanings (1) "craftsman"; (2) "holy, inviolable"—or these are two words of identical phonetic form'. There would seem to be, then, an overlay of Mongol *darkhan* 'craftsman' on the Turkic substratum *tarḡan* 'honoured' etc., giving an honorific meaning of, say, 'noble smith, honourable Master'. What repercussions the accentuation of the first syllable in the Mongol form and of the second in the Turkic may have had, must be left to the philologists.

¹⁴⁸ *BM*, 1757 ff.; 2189 ff.

¹⁴⁹ *dah jak*. The soothsayer interprets the fire-cracks, a very ancient type of divination in the Far East.

¹⁵⁰ Though it is not in the text, Radlov's muse inspired him to add, completing the verse-measure: 'Du Hund!'

English Finsburg
basic formula will

the lance-thrusts for
comrades, perish

armourer, it would
which epic poetry—

the titles *darḡan* and
real passage within

the flow. Tökör has
Yash-Aydar as a

prize by Bok Murun;
being put to death

clarity, addressing
himself with

heroic poetry,
146. Moreover

is later rewarded
with a meal.

A. T. Hatto, 'Snake-
E. *wu* means not only
altun *kündöp* *élagan*

ferred to it is always by
147 f.). At first sight,
darḡan, the high title

'Künstler' and in his
gives the primary

'noble', 'honourable'.
Targil, the transferred

most distinguished
we find *darḡan*

Kazakh-English
Kazakhstan, i.e. the part

Karakalpaksko-
privileged'

(Moscow, 1959). Tatar
the historic 'high

Institut Yazyka,
it appears that there
in a generalized and
and Middle High
honourable sir'

came from the same eastern region; and if the inference of pro-Janir propaganda is correct, this common source would be situated in the later 1820's or even early 1830's, i.e. a good generation earlier than *K* and *BM*. Such a date would harmonize with their divergent evolution. Lastly, there is no reason for not assuming on the basis of this mid-nineteenth-century material that earlier oral poems on the theme of Kōkötōy's Funeral Feast with a more developed role for Bok Murun may have antedated the 1820's considerably.

Typical of *K*'s version of the common source is the presentation of Kōkötōy as a great Khan of the Nogay with his White Pavilion (*ak ordo*?) as his central headquarters, with a magnificent old-fashioned, possibly archaizing funeral, mausoleum, and funeral games; with a suspect hill 'Navel of the Earth' misplaced on the Chinese *limes*; with a mythic or pseudo-mythic journey to the 'Inner Khan' in the Altay Mountains—all suggesting (until disproved) learned influence on a bard of some refinement who stood near to the tribal centre. The lost Kirgiz original of *K* was an oral composition in verse which employed head-rhyme to link couplets and also used the parallelistic technique, whether in couplets or in quatrains (one of which latter was misplaced from the beginning of Bok Murun's Plan to its middle). Its use of epithets tended to be static.

BM's version is appreciably lower in tone, indeed it can descend very low, so that if *K* suggests the adjective 'courtly', *BM* requires 'plebeian'. It evinces a higher degree of assimilation to the *Manas* cycle, for *M* assumed Kōkötōy's and Bok Murun's role as lord of the Nogay, and *P* on a very early aristia for *Manas*. Despite its often vulgar tone it possesses set lyrical passages that formulate the heroic ethos in a manner which is classic. A fine heroic song which had known better days is in process of slow disintegration, a process reflected in its sometimes quite remarkable epithets, which, for their part, may turn out to possess more genuine 'ancientry' than the archaizing features of *K*. Radlov's text of *BM* is open to improvement by normal philological methods. His translation is so hasty that comparatists use it at their peril.

In order to assure integrity of method it was held that until the mid-nineteenth-century material has been sifted in the original and the twentieth-century material has been edited, published, and analysed, it will be dangerous to attempt to co-ordinate the *Manas* material of these two centuries.

I have to thank Sir Harold Bailey, Dr. C. R. Bawden, Dr. V. L. Ménage, and Dr. T. O. Gandjei for helpful suggestions while I was writing part II of this study. The use I have made of their help is entirely my own responsibility.

My grateful thanks are due to the late Sir Thomas Creed, K.B.E., and the Governors of Queen Mary College for the award of a year's study-leave (1967-8) to enable me to pursue the comparative study of heroic epic poetry and in particular Kirgiz epic poetry.

